

# **The Chicago Council of Lawyers Evaluation Report: Judges Seeking Retention in the November 2018 General Election and Judicial Candidates Seeking to Fill Judicial Vacancies**

September 25, 2018

The Chicago Council of Lawyers, in this report, releases its evaluation of the judges seeking retention in the November 5th general election. We also include in this report our evaluation of the candidates who won their primary election held in March 2018 and who are on the November ballot.

## **EVALUATION METHODOLOGY FOR RETENTION CANDIDATES**

The criteria for the Council's evaluations are whether the retention candidate has demonstrated the ability to serve on the relevant court in the following categories:

- fairness, including sensitivity to diversity and bias
- legal knowledge and skills (competence)
- integrity
- experience
- diligence
- impartiality
- judicial temperament
- respect for the rule of law
- independence from political and institutional influences
- professional conduct
- character
- community service

If a candidate has demonstrated the ability to perform the work required of a judge in all of these areas, the Council assigns a rating of “qualified.” If a candidate has demonstrated excellence in most of these areas, the Council assigns a rating of “well qualified.” If a candidate has demonstrated excellence in all of these areas, the Council assigns a rating of “highly qualified.” If a candidate has not demonstrated that he or she meets all of the criteria evaluated by the Council, the Council assigns a rating of “not qualified.”

As part of the evaluation process, we require candidates to provide us with detailed information about their backgrounds, including any complaints filed against them with the Attorney Registration and Disciplinary Commission (“ARDC”) or the Judicial Inquiry Board (“JIB”).

In conducting these evaluations, the Council has participated in a joint investigation and interview process with the Alliance of Bar Associations for Judicial Screening (“Alliance”). The Alliance includes the following bar associations: Asian American Bar Association, Black Women Lawyers Association, Chicago Council of Lawyers, Cook County Bar Association, Decalogue Society of Lawyers, Hellenic Bar Association, Hispanic Lawyers’ Association of Illinois, Illinois State Bar Association, Lesbian and Gay Bar Association of Chicago, Puerto Rican Bar Association, and the Women’s Bar Association of Illinois.

The Council’s evaluation process includes:

- (1) a review of a written informational questionnaire provided to the Alliance by the candidate, including details of the candidate’s career and professional development and information on any complaints filed against the candidate with the JIB or the ARDC;
- (2) a review of the candidate’s written responses to the supplemental essay questionnaire;
- (3) interviews of judges, attorneys, and others with personal knowledge about the candidate, including those who have and those who have not been referred to the Alliance by the candidate, and not restricted to Council members;
- (4) a review of the candidate’s professional written work, where available;
- (5) an interview of the candidate done jointly with the Alliance;
- (6) review of any information concerning the candidate provided by the ARDC or the JIB;
- (7) a review of any other information available from public records, such as the Board of Election Commissioners and prosecutorial agencies; and
- (8) an evaluation of all the above materials by the Council’s Judicial Evaluation Committee;
- (9) submission of the proposed evaluation and write-up to the candidate prior to its public release, to provide an opportunity for comment, correction, or reconsideration.

- (10) the candidate is given a reasonable period of time to submit a written appeal of the Council's rating and written findings. The appeal is a written response to concerns discussed in the proposed write-up. The appeal is reviewed by both members of the original committee and by individuals who work with the Committee exclusively for appeals. Appellate decision-making is done by consensus.

The Council places special importance on interviews with attorneys who practice before the judge, particularly those who were not referred to the Council by the candidate. Most evaluations are based on information gathered and interviews held during the few months just prior to the general election.

In evaluating candidates, the Council expresses written reasons for its conclusions. Without knowing the reason for a recommendation concerning a candidate, the public cannot use the bar's evaluations intelligently to draw its own conclusions.

### **THE IMPORTANCE OF THE RETENTION ELECTIONS**

The retention elections provide the voter with an opportunity to remove those judges whose judicial performance has been, in some respect, unsatisfactory. Retention elections provide the only practical opportunity for the voters as a whole to focus on the performance of judges, with a realistic opportunity to defeat those candidates who deserve to be defeated.

### **EVALUATION METHODOLOGY FOR JUDICIAL CANDIDATES IN CONTESTED ELECTIONS**

Judicial candidates seeking election must run for specific vacancies. Candidates seeking election to the Circuit Court – which is the County's trial-level court for both civil and criminal matters – may run in either a countywide or a subcircuit race. Legislation creating the subcircuits provides that approximately one-third of the judges are elected by voters of the entire County, and each of the remaining judges elected by voters runs in one of fifteen geographical districts into which the County has been arbitrarily divided. Once elected, there is no distinction between a "countywide" judge and a "subcircuit" judge. Either kind can be assigned to any judicial post in the County.

The Council rates candidates as "*highly qualified*," "*well qualified*," "*qualified*," or "*not qualified*." If a candidate refuses to submit his or her credentials to the Council, that candidate is rated "*not recommended*" unless the Council is aware of credible information that would justify a "not qualified" rating. Because we believe a willingness to participate in bar association and other public evaluations is a key indicator of fitness for public office, no candidate who refuses to be screened can be found "qualified."

We apply higher standards to candidates for the Supreme Court and the Appellate Court. Because these Courts establish legal precedents that bind the lower courts, their work has a broad impact on the justice system. Moreover, qualities of scholarship and writing ability are more important to the work of the Supreme and Appellate Court justices than they are to satisfactory performance as a trial judge.

The Council does *not* evaluate candidates based on their substantive views of political or social issues. Nor do we take into account the particular race in which a candidate is running or the candidates against whom a candidate is running. We apply a uniform standard for all

countywide and subcircuit elections because judges elected through either method can be assigned to any judicial position in the Circuit Court.

It should be noted that a lawyer might be performing well or even very well without being qualified to be a judge. A good lawyer may be unqualified to be a judge, for instance, because of a narrow range of prior experience, limited trial experience, or limited work doing legal research and writing. A lawyer may have the temperament and intelligence to be a judge without yet having worked in a position that would allow the candidate to demonstrate that capacity. Accordingly, it should be recognized and expected that we will rate some good lawyers “not qualified.”

---

### **Retention Elections (all ballots)**

**Judge Martin S. Agran** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1972. Prior to becoming a judge, Martin S. Agran served as an Assistant Cook County State’s Attorney and was in private practice. He was also a panel attorney with the Federal Defender’s Office for 14 years. He was appointed to the Circuit Court in 1994 and elected to the bench the same year. Since 2011, he has been assigned to the Third Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Rolling Meadows, Illinois, where he is on civil call. His previous judicial assignments were at the Chancery Division (2004 to 2011); the Law Division (2001 to 2004); Juvenile Court, Juvenile Justice Division (1996-2001); Juvenile Court, Child Protection Division (1994-1996); and the First Municipal Division (1994).

Judge Agran is well respected and is seen as a thoughtful jurist who comes to the right conclusion. He is praised for his temperament as well as his courtroom management skills. He keeps the call moving but gives the litigants ample time to make their case. Judge Agran is reported to be fair and is especially praised for his handling of pro se litigants. The Council finds him Well Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Thomas R. Allen** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1977. He was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2011. From 1990 to 2010, he was a partner with Chapekis Marcus Allen & Chapekis. From 1986 to 1990, he was a sole practitioner doing criminal defense, real estate, and litigation. From 1987 to 1992 he was a Panel Attorney for the Federal Defender Program and from 1976 to 1986, he served as an Assistant Cook County Public Defender. He served as a Chicago Alderman from 1993 to 2010. He was elected to the bench in 2012.

Since 2012, he has been assigned to Calendar 10 of the Chancery Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. His call consists of all causes of action sounding in equity including, but not limited to, injunctions, condominium disputes, declaratory judgments, temporary restraining orders, complaints in administrative review, shareholder derivative disputes, and claims of breach of fiduciary duty. He also serves, by appointment, on two Supreme Court Committees: the Legislative Committee of the Supreme Court (Member, 2011-present) and the Alternative Dispute Resolution Coordinating Committee (Chair, 2015-present). His previous judicial assignments were in the Probate Division (2011-2012) and Traffic Court (2010-2011).

Judge Allen is considered to have good courtroom management skills and to have a very good temperament. He is respectful to both litigants and lawyers. He is described as “practical” in his approach to ruling, and respondents generally find him to be a good judge. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court..

**Judge Larry G. Axelrood** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1985. He became an Associate Judge in 2005. From 1989 to 2005 Judge Axelrood worked as a sole practitioner specializing in criminal defense. From 1985 to 1989, he served as an Assistant Cook County State’s Attorney. He was elected to the bench in 2012.

Since February 2017, he has been assigned to a jury room in the Law Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois, where he is responsible for hearing jury trials and pre-trial settlement conferences. His previous judicial assignments were in the Law Division, Motion section, Courtroom 2208 (2014-2017); in the Second District and Criminal Division in Skokie, Illinois (2004-2007), the Third District in Rolling Meadows, Illinois (2005-2007), and the First District (2005). In 2012, the Chicago Council of Lawyers rated him as well-qualified.

Judge Axelrood is praised for his knowledge of the law and for being a hard-working jurist who is exceptionally respectful of both litigants and lawyers. He is also well regarded for his ability and willingness to deal with pro se litigants – being fair without providing the legal assistance that a judge cannot provide. He is reported to be well-prepared. He is praised for being fair in his rulings. The Council finds him Well Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Ronald F. Bartkowicz** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1965. Prior to becoming a judge, Ronald Bartkowicz was an attorney for the Chicago Transit Authority for 20 years. Judge Bartkowicz was appointed in 1985 as an Associate Judge and appointed as a Circuit Court judge in 1997. He was elected to the Circuit Court in 2000. Since September 2017, he has been assigned to the General Calendar J of the Law Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. His previous judicial assignments were in the Trial Section, Law Division, Courtroom 2609 (2014-2017), Commercial Calendar Y, Courtroom 2101 (2001-2014), Trial Section, Law Division, Courtroom 2101 (1998-2001), and First Municipal District, various assignments (1985-1998).

Respondents indicated that Judge Bartkowicz has excellent courtroom management skills. His courtroom was consistently described as a “level playing field” with few exceptions. He is described as “effective” in his use of pretrial time. He is considered hard-working and very diligent, with more than one respondent commenting on his long hours in a typical day. Judge Bartkowicz is knowledgeable about substantive and procedural law on his cases. Overall, Judge Bartkowicz is well-respected as a diligent and capable judge. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Carl B. Boyd** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1991. Prior to taking the bench, he was in private practice. He was elected to the bench in 2012. Since March 2017, he has been assigned to the Felony Division, Room 108, Sixth Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Markham, Illinois. He presides over all assigned felony matters from arraignments

through jury trials. His previous judicial assignments were in the Civil and Criminal Divisions in the Sixth Municipal District (2014-2017); the Civil Division, First Municipal District (2013-2014), and Traffic, First Municipal District (2012-2013).

Judge Boyd is considered to have good knowledge of the law, and to have a good judicial temperament. He is reported to be respectful to litigants and lawyers. He is praised for his courtroom management skills. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Maura Slattery Boyle** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1993. Prior to becoming a judge, Maura Slattery Boyle spent six years as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney and also worked at the City of Chicago's Department of Law. Judge Slattery Boyle was elected to the Circuit Court in 2000. Since 2009, she has been assigned to the Criminal Division of the Circuit Court. She conducts bench trials, jury trials and motions for felony cases and also presides over pleas and post-convictions matter. Her previous judicial assignments were at the First Municipal District (2005-2009), Branch 38 (2003-2005), and Traffic Court (2000-2003).

Judge Slattery Boyle is considered by most lawyers interviewed to have good knowledge of the law, and many lawyers praise her temperament. However, the Council is concerned by multiple reports that she can be insensitive to defendants in her courtroom. In addition, sentencing information the Council has reviewed suggests that she issues very harsh sentences compared to other criminal division judges.

The Council is also concerned about what the Illinois Appellate Court has said about Judge Slattery Boyle. In *People v. Serrano*, the Appellate Court reversed her with orders that the case be reassigned to a different judge on remand. According to the Appellate Court, Judge Slattery Boyle did not consider certain evidence, and also refused to admit probative, admissible evidence that, when evaluated under the proper standard, is damning.

"Petitioner would be prejudiced were we not to assign the case to a new judge on remand. Therefore, pursuant to the discretion conferred on this court by the supreme court rules, we find that the interests of justice would be best and most efficiently served by the case being assigned to a different judge on remand."

Similarly, in *People v. Rosado*, 2017 IL App (1st) 143741, ¶ 42-47, the Appellate Court reversed Judge Slattery Boyle for a number of evidentiary errors, and ordered the case (on remand) to the chief judge for reassignment to a different judge. In its original opinion, the Appellate Court did not explain the reassignment, and the State filed a petition for rehearing arguing the court did not have the power to order the case reassigned to a different judge. In a second order, Justice Hyman, speaking for the Appellate Court, stated:

"The State has now petitioned for rehearing, arguing that we do not have that power under Rule 366 and that we failed to explain our reasoning for those instructions. Indeed, we did not explain—out of a desire to spare the trial court some embarrassment. But since the State asks for an explanation, we will provide one... In ruling on the other-crimes issue, the trial court made specific comments regarding the jury's verdict in acquitting Rosado on the March 29 transaction. The judge stated that the evidence against Rosado was "quite clear." It attributed the acquittal to the prosecutors not asking the right questions and leaving issues "up in the air," which allowed Rosado's attorneys to argue reasonable doubt..."

“Here, the trial court reversed its own evidentiary rulings between cases (for no discernible reason) and then made a lengthy statement indicating its belief in Rosado's guilt. We have not ordered the case reassigned due to trial court error in its evidentiary rulings... Outward appearances would suggest that the trial court changed its evidentiary rulings in the second case to ensure that Rosado was not acquitted again.”

The Council must balance concerns over these issues with positive reports from some lawyers. On balance, the Council finds her Not Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Daniel Patrick Brennan** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1995. Prior to becoming a judge, Daniel Patrick Brennan was counsel to the Cook County Sheriff. Judge Brennan was elected to the Circuit Court in 2006. In 2012, the Chicago Council of Lawyers rated him as qualified. Since 2012, he has been assigned to the Chancery Division, Mortgage Foreclosure/Mechanics Lien Section of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. His previous judicial assignments were at the Sixth Municipal District in Markham, Illinois (2008-2011) and the First Municipal District (2006-2008).

Judge Brennan is praised in particular his handling of *pro se* litigants and the overall fairness of his courtroom. He is called fair, rational, thorough and calm. Attorneys report that Judge Brennan will often telegraph his inclination prior to argument, but does not cut off argument and appears to consider what is presented to him. He is described as not inclined to rush cases through his courtroom.

Overall, Judge Brennan received good ratings from the respondents. Most attorneys interviewed stated they believed he was diligent. One attorney mentioned that Judge Brennan always had notes on the cases before trial and that he “gives a preview that allows you to better manage your case.” Judge Brennan was also highly praised for his judicial temperament.

This judge was also praised for his fairness and integrity; his reputation among attorneys is excellent. He was consistently praised for his fairness and integrity and seen as a well-informed judge who has the ability to keep an even temper even when dealing with a high-volume courtroom. He is described as being well prepared and is praised for his courtroom management skills. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Tommy Hoskins Brewer** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1976. He is assigned to the Sixth Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Markham, Illinois, where is Presiding Judge (March 2018-present) and previously was Acting Presiding Judge (January 2017-March 2018). His previous judicial assignment was as “Floating Judge”, where he presided over Felony, Child Support, Domestic Violence, Traffic and Misdemeanor courtrooms.

As a sitting judge, Judge Brewer is considered to be knowledgeable, hard working, and fair as a judge. He is praised for his temperament. As a Presiding Judge, he is also praised for his focus on reducing the backlog in the Markham courthouse, and for his willingness to utilize new approaches to improve the administration of justice. One example is Judge Brewer's embrace of the use of administrative hearing officers to improve the adjudication of family law cases where

neither party is represented by legal counsel. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Mary Margaret Brosnahan** was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1986. Prior to becoming a judge, Mary Margaret Brosnahan was a career prosecutor in the Cook County State's Attorney's Office. From 1997, Judge Brosnahan was a Supervisor in the Felony Trial Division where she supervised eighteen Assistant State's Attorneys in the Felony Trial Courts. Judge Brosnahan was elected to the Circuit Court in 2000. Since 2017, she has been a Supervising Judge in the Criminal Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Since 2006, she has been assigned to Felony Trial Court in the Criminal Division, where she handles approximately 300 felony cases that range from class 4 felonies to first degree murder, as well as probation matters and post judgment matters. Her previous judicial assignments were at the Central Bond Court, First Municipal District (2001-2005) and Traffic Court, First Municipal District (2001).

Judge Brosnahan received consistently high marks in all areas surveyed. Interviewees described her as having "outstanding ability", saying it was always "clear she read the law and used logic to arrive at her decisions." She was also highly praised for her courtroom management. Respondents stated that Judge Brosnahan was well prepared, prompt, and efficient. While she keeps her call moving, Respondents gave Judge Brosnahan high marks for diligence and attention to detail. Overall, Judge Brosnahan was consistently praised for her knowledge and application of the law and her courtroom management skills. She is also seen as a very diligent and well informed judge who has the ability to keep her call moving while giving appropriate attention to all matters before her. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court..

**Justice Anne M. Burke** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1983. In 2006, was appointed to be a Justice of the Supreme Court of Illinois, and she elected to a full term in 2008. Her previous judicial assignments were as Justice of the Illinois Appellate Court, First District (1995-2006) and Judge on the Illinois Court of Claims (1987-1994).

Justice Burke is considered to have good legal knowledge, and is exceptionally hard working. She is praised for being well prepared at oral arguments and for the quality of her written opinions. Justice Burke is also active in the area of criminal justice reform and is praised by advocates for her efforts. She is an active participant and leader of the Justice Advisory Council and is currently devoted to bail reform. Her efforts at reform often demonstrate her commitment to eliminating bias in the judicial system. Justice Burke is consistently praised for her temperament, and respondents often reference her extensive community involvement. In light of her extensive involvement in community activities and court reform efforts, the Council finds her Well Qualified for retention to the Illinois Supreme Court.

**Judge Michael Robert Clancy** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1989. Before becoming a judge, he served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney from 1990 to 2002 where he was a well-respected first chair felony prosecutor. He then went into private practice doing



criminal defense work. He was elected to the bench in 2012. Since September 2017, he has been assigned to the Pretrial Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. His call includes conducting initial bail hearings on felony and misdemeanor criminal cases, as well as preliminary hearings in felony traffic cases, presiding in a preliminary hearing courtroom involving murder and sexual assault cases, and presiding over extradition cases involving fugitives from another state. His previous judicial assignments were in the Domestic Violence Division (2013-2017) and the First Municipal District (2011-2013).

Judge Clancy is considered to have good legal ability. Since his last evaluation in 2012, Judge Clancy spent most of judicial assignments was in the Domestic Violence Division. There he was praised for his legal knowledge and his ability to apply facts to the law. He was praised for being thorough in his legal analysis, and for being fair and respectful to all parties. In 2017, he was assigned to the Pretrial Division where his work in Central Bond Court has been scrutinized. He was among the judges assigned to this position by Chief Judge Evans as part of a substantial overhaul of the money bond system in Cook County. In a report issued by the Coalition to End Money Bond, a group comprised of legal and community organizations, Judge Clancy was singled out as a jurist who was ordering money bond be imposed more often and in amounts substantially higher than most of the other Central Bond Court judges. The Council is concerned about this differential, but recognizes that Chief Judge's changes in the Bond Court have been in place for less than one year. The Council urges Judge Clancy to reconsider his actions, but we also recognize that he has received good marks as a judge in his previous assignments. On balance, the Council finds Judge Clancy Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Matthew E. Coghlan** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1987. Prior to becoming a judge, Matthew Coghlan was an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. Judge Coghlan was elected in 2000. Since 2007, he has been assigned to the Criminal Court of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. He is currently assigned to a felony trial courtroom, where his duties involve the management of felony criminal cases from arraignment to disposition. His previous judicial assignments were in the First Municipal District, in Central Bond Court/Preliminary Hearings (2003-2007), Domestic Violence Court (2001-2003), and Traffic Court (2000-2001).

Judge Coghlan presents a difficult case. He is generally said to have good legal knowledge and ability. Some lawyers have given us examples of how Judge Coghlan is respectful toward all the parties. Other lawyers, particularly those who are non-white, believe that he can be condescending and otherwise disrespectful toward non-white lawyers and defendants in his courtroom. There is also a mix of opinions as to whether Judge Coghlan demonstrates a bias in favor of the prosecution.

The Council is concerned about Judge Coghlan's performance as a prosecutor before he took the bench. He has been mentioned in several recent news articles and is currently a defendant in federal court civil rights actions involving wrongful convictions. We note, however, that these actions involve allegations not yet proven.

Judge Coghlan's performance as a judge was called into question in the case of *People v. Nicholas*, 2017 IL App (1st) 160229-U (November 20, 2017).

Antonio Nicholas has claimed since 1991 that police detectives working under Cmdr. Jon Burge tortured him into wrongly confessing to murder and attempted murder. The issue in his case was whether Nicholas deserved a belated hearing on his claims that he had been forced to wrongly confess.

Nicholas' post-conviction petition case was assigned to Judge Coghlan, who ruled in 2010 that there wasn't enough credible evidence to merit a hearing — and that Nicholas had failed to timely raise the matter.

A three-judge panel of the Illinois Appellate Court reversed Judge Coghlan in March 2013, finding Nicholas had shown sufficient evidence to merit a hearing into whether his confession was coerced and he was wrongly convicted. On remand, Judge Coghlan appeared to have disregarded the evidence and reasoning identified and articulated by the Illinois Appellate Court in reversing his decision, and again refused to grant Nicholas a hearing. The decision was again appealed to the Illinois Appellate Court, and this new panel of judges aggressively questioned the basis used by Judge Coghlan to deny Nicholas a hearing. The Appellate Court reversed and remanded Judge Coghlan's decision a second time, but this time assigned the case to a different judge. This action by an Illinois Appellate Court is rare.

The Council must balance these negative issues relating to Judge Coghlan with the positive reports we have received from some lawyers. On balance, the Council finds him Not Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Daniel R. Degnan** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1995. Since 2016 he has been assigned to the Probate Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois, where he presides over Adult Guardianship cases. His previous judicial assignments were in the Domestic Relations Division, where he presided over Parentage cases (2014-2016), and in the First Municipal District, where his call included Traffic and Civil Non-Jury cases (2012-2014).

Judge Degnan is praised by judges and lawyers for his work ethic, intelligence, and demeanor. He is described as a "quick learner" and is praised for his court management skills and his professional demeanor. The Council finds him Qualified for retention.

**Grace G. Dickler** became an Associate Judge in 1988 and was elected to the Circuit Court in 2006. Since 2011 has served as the Presiding Judge of the Domestic Relations Division. She was previously the Presiding Judge of the Domestic Violence Division. She has been in the Domestic Relations Division since 1991. Prior to taking the bench, she served as a legal aid attorney, a federal Immigration Judge, and an administrative law judge for the Human Rights Commission.

Lawyers describe Judge Dickler as having outstanding ability as both a judge and an administrator. As a judge, she is reported to be decisive with a good demeanor. She is described as respectful to the parties before her, but maintains control of her courtroom. She is exceptionally knowledgeable about her area of law, and she rules in a timely manner without showing a bias toward or against any party.

As a Presiding Judge, she has acted affirmatively to bring about systemic reforms. She was instrumental in establishing rules for financial mediation in Domestic Relations cases, as well as a special domestic relations call for prisoners over which she often presides. She assembled a

task force to oversee the consolidation of the divorce and parentage courts – separate but unequal courts based on the marital status of the parents. That consolidation took place in February 2017. In March 2017, she launched a program through which the process of adjudicating child support for unmarried couples became more fair and efficient through the use of administrative hearing officers. In addition, Judge Dickler was responsible for establishing an online parenting class, a child representative project with Chicago Volunteer Legal Services (CVLS), and the inclusion of her Domestic Relations Division in the Family Court Enhancement Project, in corroboration with the Office on Violence Against Women and the National Council of Juvenile and Family Court Judges. The Council finds her Highly Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge John H. Ehrlich** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1998. Prior to becoming a judge, he worked in the City of Chicago Law Department and has been Chief Assistant Corporation Counsel in the Torts Division. Prior to that, he was in private practice handling commercial litigation matters. He was elected to the bench in 2012. Since 2014, he has been assigned to the County Department, Motion Section of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois, where his docket consists of non-commercial tort cases. His previous judicial assignments were in the County Department, Chancery Division, Foreclosure Section (2013) and the Municipal Department, First Municipal Division, Traffic Section (2012-2013).

Judge Ehrlich is considered to have very good legal ability and is praised for issuing well reasoned orders and opinions. He is very knowledgeable and viewed by other judges as a resource. He is generally described as having a good temperament. He is reported to be well prepared. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Kathy M. Flanagan** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1979. Prior to becoming a judge, Kathy Flanagan was in private practice. Judge Flanagan was elected to the Circuit Court in 1988. Since 2010, she has been Supervising Judge of the Law Division, Motion Section of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Her previous judicial assignments were in the Domestic Relations Division (Preliminary Motion Judge, 1992-1994; Trial Judge, 1988-1990).

Judge Flanagan is considered to be very informed on the law as it applies to the Law Division. She applies the law and rules rigorously, and cases move through her courtroom quickly and on a tight schedule. She is praised for the quality of her decisions. However, practitioners have strong opinions about her temperament. Well respected practitioners describe her as tough, fair, and efficient. Other equally well-respected practitioners believe she is unduly harsh, overbearing, and sometimes disrespectfully aggressive with litigants, with deadlines too often set without any input from litigants. She is reported to threaten sanctions, including daily fines for non-compliance with discovery deadlines. On balance, the Council finds her Not Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Ellen L. Flannigan** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1988. Prior to becoming a judge, Ellen L. Flannigan worked as an attorney in private practice. Judge Flannigan was elected to the

Circuit Court in 2006. Since 2016, she has been assigned to the Domestic Relations Division, Hearings and Trials, of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Her previous assignments were with the Domestic Relations as a Parentage Expedited Judge (2012-2016) and an Expedited Hearing Judge (2009-2012), and in the First Municipal District (2006-2009, traffic citations and misdemeanor traffic matters).

Judge Flannigan is reported to have a good grasp of legal issues. She is described as having good legal ability with rulings that are well reasoned and clearly stated. She is praised for her grasp of the law, for her ability to control the courtroom, and for her temperament. She is praised for her patience on the bench – informing the parties about the process and explaining her rulings. Many respondents to this evaluation praise her integrity and her commitment to improving the operation of the court to make it fairer. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Peter Anthony Flynn** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1969. Prior to becoming a judge, Peter Flynn was in private practice, focusing on complex business litigation. Judge Flynn was appointed to the Circuit Court in 1999 and elected in 2000. Since 2002, he has been assigned to Chancery Calendar 4 of the Circuit Court of Cook County, Illinois, where he handles general equity cases. His previous assignments were in the Law Division Commercial Calendar Section (2000-2002) and Traffic Court (1999-2000).

Judge Flynn is considered to have good legal ability. He is reported to be thorough and conscientious, and is praised for his courtroom management skills. He has a good temperament, but is willing to criticize unprepared attorneys from the bench. His rulings are thoughtful and well researched. Overall, he receives praise as a solid jurist. The Council finds him Well Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge John Terrence Gallagher** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1988. Prior to becoming a judge, he had been a sole practitioner since 1996. He tried cases in both state and federal courts. From 1994 to 1996 he worked at the Law Office of Edward R. Vrdolyak where he represented clients in criminal matters, and from 1992 to 1994 he worked at Augustine, Kern, & Levens where he litigated civil matters, mostly contract cases with some injury cases. He worked in the U.S. Navy Judge Advocate General's Corps between 1988 and 1992. He was elected to the bench in 2012. Since 2014, he has been assigned to the Fifth Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Bridgeview, Illinois, where he presides over a misdemeanor courtroom. His previous assignments were to a misdemeanor courtroom at Branch 35 in Chicago, Illinois (2013-2014) and to the First Municipal District Traffic Call in the Daley Center (2012-2013).

Judge Gallagher is considered to have good legal ability. He is praised for his knowledge of the law. His temperament is described as low key and he is respectful of all parties. He is praised for his courtroom management and for being fair in his rulings. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge William Gamboney** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1977. Prior to becoming a judge, he spent a few years in private practice, and then served as an Assistant Cook County State's

Attorney between 1979 and 1994. He was a sole practitioner since 1994. He was elected to the bench in 2012. Since November 2017, he has been assigned as a Floater Judge in the Criminal Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. His previous assignments were in the Juvenile Justice Division (2013-2017) and the First Municipal Division (2012-2013, Traffic and various Branch Courts in Chicago).

Judge Gamboney is considered to have good legal ability. He is especially praised for his communications with jurors. He has a good temperament and is reported to be adept at handling his court call. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Celia Gamrath** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1994. Prior to becoming a judge, Before becoming a judge, she was a partner at Schiller DuCanto and Fleck where she handled family law litigation, complex motion practice, and appeals. From 1994 to 1997, she served as a judicial law clerk in the Illinois Appellate Court. She was appointed to the bench in 2010, and was elected to the bench in 2012. Since 2016, she has been assigned to the General Chancery Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Her previous assignments were in the Domestic Relations Division (Trial Judge, 2010-2016) and the Municipal Division at the Daley Center (Traffic, 2010).

Judge Gamrath is considered to have good legal ability and knowledge of the law. She is described as always being prepared and is praised for her temperament. She is generally described as hard working and is praised for managing a sometimes difficult court call. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Joyce Marie Murphy Gorman** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1995. Prior to becoming a judge, Joyce M. Murphy Gorman worked with the Office of the Presiding Judge of the Sixth Municipal District in Markham for four years. Judge Murphy Gorman then worked as a sole practitioner for one year immediately before being elected to the bench. Judge Murphy Gorman was elected to the Circuit Court in 2000. Since 2017, she has been a civil judge assigned to the Sixth Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Markham, Illinois. Her call includes eviction, personal injury, and tort and contract cases. She was previously assigned to the First Municipal District, first to Traffic Court (2000 to 2002) and later to civil non-jury trial call (2002-2017).

Judge Murphy Gorman is considered to have good legal ability and received positive reviews on her trial management skills. Lawyers report that her rulings are generally fair and accurate. She is described as “even-keeled on the bench and is praised for her handling of pro se litigants. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Catherine Marie Haberkorn** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1981. Prior to becoming a judge, Catherine Haberkorn was an Assistant Cook County State’s Attorney throughout her career, handling both criminal and civil law cases. Judge Haberkorn was elected to the Circuit Court in 1994. Since 2000, she has been a Criminal Felony Judge in the Circuit Court of Cook County in Skokie, Illinois. Previously she was assigned to Night Narcotics Court in the Criminal Felony Trial Division (1997-1999) and to the Juvenile Delinquency Division (1994-1997).

Judge Haberkorn is praised for her legal knowledge and for her ability to manage her court call. She is part of a special drug probation court call in which she is reported to be doing a very job of handling defendants who have significant drug abuse history and mental health issues. She is reported to be fair and patient on the bench. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Elizabeth Mary Hayes** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1986. Prior to becoming a judge, she served as an Assistant Cook County Public Defender involved in misdemeanor matters. She was a Hearing Officer in the Child Protection Division and worked in the Child Protection Division as a court coordinator. She was a staff attorney with the Illinois Guardianship & Advocacy Commission, Legal Advocacy Services. She was elected to the bench in 2012. Since January of 2017 she has been assigned to the Fifth Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Bridgeview, Illinois. She currently handles misdemeanor cases but previously her court call there included traffic matters (2015-2017). She has also handled domestic violence, parenthood, and other civil matters in both the Fifth (2015) and Sixth Municipal Districts (2013-2015), as well as traffic matters in the Sixth Municipal District (2012-2013).

Judge Hayes is considered to have good legal ability. She is reported to be knowledgeable, well prepared, and does her own research, if necessary. She is praised for her courtroom management skills and for treating pro se litigants with respect. She has a good temperament, with lawyers noting her patience and her ability to move her call. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Carol Marie Howard** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1986. Prior to becoming a judge, Carol Howard worked as an Assistant Cook County Public Defender. Judge Howard was elected to the Circuit Court in 2006. Since 2009, she has been assigned to the Criminal Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County at 2600 S. California Avenue in Chicago, Illinois. Previously, she was assigned to the First Municipal District (2006-2009).

Judge Howard is reported by most attorneys to be knowledgeable with good legal ability. She is praised for her temperament, as well as her courtroom management. She is especially praised for her patience on the bench. Fair, even-tempered, patient and pleasant were common descriptors. Her handling of cases is called reasonable and attorneys noted her practical, real world approach to the lower level offenses before her. Some prosecuting attorneys complain that she favors the defense. But most attorneys praise her fairness and diligence. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Moshe Jacobius** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1975. Prior to becoming a judge, Moshe Jacobius was with the Illinois Attorney General's Office for his entire career. Judge Jacobius was appointed to the Circuit Court in 1991. Since 2010, he has been Presiding Judge of the Chancery Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County. There, he is responsible for administering the General Chancery and Mortgage Foreclosure/Mechanics Lien Section; in addition, he hears motions and trials on Chancery cases. He has held previous assignments in

the Chancery Division (2000) in the Domestic Relations Division (Presiding Judge, 2000-2010; Calendar 51, 1991-2000).

Judge Jacobius is considered exceptionally knowledgeable with very good legal ability. His rulings are reported to be clear and timely. His temperament is described as understanding, compassionate, dignified, and professional. He is reported to move his call efficiently. The Council finds him Well Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Paul Karkula**, prior to becoming a judge, worked as an Assistant Cook County Public Defender and as Corporation Counsel to the Town of Cicero. He was in private practice immediately before joining the bench. Judge Karkula was elected in 2000. He was initially assigned to the First Municipal District Traffic Center and subsequently transferred to the Chancery Division for the foreclosure call. Judge Karkula is presently assigned to the County Division.

Judge Karkula is considered to have good legal ability, and is described as even-tempered and patient. He is praised for his courtroom management, and lawyers generally praise his fairness. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Lionel Jean-Baptiste** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1991. Prior to becoming a judge, he had served as the Alderman for the 2<sup>nd</sup> Ward of Evanston, Illinois. He was appointed to the bench in 2011. At the time of his appointment to the bench, he was a sole practitioner doing administrative law (such as representing clients before the Illinois Department of Human Rights) and litigation. From 1997 to 2001 he practiced law with state Senator Kwame Raoul. He was a sole practitioner between 1993 and 1997 and from 1991 to 1993 he practiced in the firm of Gainer & Dillard. He was elected to the bench in 2012.

Since 2012, he has been assigned to the Domestic Relations Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Currently, he hears parenting and divorce issues; previously (2012-2016), his call included child support, custody, and visitation matters. From 2011 to 2012, he was assigned to the Municipal Department (Traffic Division) at the Daley Center. In addition to his courtroom, he also serves as an appointed member of the Committee on Child Support of the Illinois Supreme Court. In 2012, the Chicago Council of Lawyers rated him as qualified.

Judge Jean-Baptiste is described as a caring jurist with good legal ability. He is reported to have good temperament and is especially praised for his dealings with those unrepresented by legal counsel. Lawyers say that he has good courtroom management skills. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Martin C. Kelley** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1992. Prior to becoming a judge, he was in private practice. He was elected to the bench in 2012. Currently, he is assigned to hear Non-Jury Civil Matters at the Third Municipal Court of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Rolling Meadows, Illinois. His previous calls at the Third Municipal Court were Parentage (2013-2015), Veterans/Mental Health Court (2014-2015), and Traffic/Misdemeanors (2013-2015). He was also assigned to Traffic/Misdemeanors in the First Municipal Court (2012-2013).

Judge Kelley is considered to have good legal ability. He is praised for his temperament and for his handling of pro se matters. He is described as giving everyone in front of him a full and complete hearing. He is reported to have a good temperament. The Council finds him Qualified for retention of the Circuit Court.

**Judge Pamela Mariam Leeming** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1990. She was appointed to the bench in 2009 by the Illinois Supreme Court. She ran for election in the 2010 primary and was defeated. She was recalled to the bench and then won election to the bench in 2012. Before being appointed to the bench she served an Assistant Cook County Public Defender. She concentrated her practice in the areas of paternity, criminal misdemeanor, preliminary hearings, a variety of other pre- and post-trial matters, and appeals. Since 2014, she has been assigned to a felony courtroom in the Fourth Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Maywood, Illinois. Previously, she was assigned to the Fourth District's Misdemeanor and Preliminary Hearing Call (2010-2014) and to Traffic Court at the Daley Center (2009-2010).

Judge Leeming is praised for her knowledge of the law and for her temperament. She is reported to have good courtroom management skills. She is respected for her thoughtful and thorough rulings. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Kimberly Dionne Lewis** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 2001. Since 2014, she has been assigned to the Juvenile Court Child Protection Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Her previous judicial assignment was in the Traffic Division of the First Municipal Court.

Judge Lewis is considered to have good legal ability and is reported to be well prepared. Her rulings are often described as "thoughtful" and she has demonstrated that she knows the law and how to apply it. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Stuart Fredric Lubin** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1974. Prior to becoming a judge, Stuart Lubin was a career Assistant Cook County Public Defender. Judge Lubin was appointed to the Circuit Court in 1991 and elected in 1994. Since 1991, he has been assigned to the Juvenile Justice Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. His previous judicial assignment was at the First Municipal Division, where his call included forcible Entry and Detainer, Housing Court, and Misdemeanors and Felony Preliminary Hearing Branch Courts.

Judge Lubin is regarded as an excellent jurist with very good legal ability. He is praised for his courtroom management skills. He is reported to have a good temperament – patient and respectful of the parties in front of him. He is praised for his integrity and fairness. The Council finds him Well Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Aicha Marie MacCarthy** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1997. Prior to becoming a judge, she was a sole practitioner handling a variety of criminal and civil law matters, with a focus on probate, real estate, and criminal law matters. From 2001 to 2008 she worked for the City of Chicago. From 2004 to 2008 she was an Assistant Commissioner at the Department of



Aviation, and from 2001 to 2004 she was Assistant to the Mayor at the Office of the Mayor. In 2001, she was a Financial Planning Analyst at the Department of Planning and Development and from 1998 to 2001, she worked as a Staff Attorney/Hearing Officer at the Chicago Housing Authority. In 1998, she served as a Traffic Division Prosecutor at the Chicago Department of Law. She was elected to the bench in 2012. Since 2013, she has been assigned to the Probate Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Her call there has included Adult Guardianship Estates (January 2017-present), Minor Guardianship (2015-2017), Disabled Adult Estates (2014-2015), and an assignment as a Floating Judge (2013-2014). From 2012 to 2013, she was assigned to the First Municipal Division, where she heard traffic, DUI, evictions, and civil non-jury cases.

Judge MacCarthy is reported to be doing a good job of balancing the needs of disabled persons and the desires of family members – a task very much part of Judge MacCarthy's current assignment. She is praised overall for her temperament and for her legal ability and breadth of knowledge. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Edward Michael Maloney** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1978. Prior to becoming a judge, he was in private practice. He was elected to the bench in 2012. Since 2013, he has been assigned to the Branch 44 - Preliminary Hearing Court of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. His previous assignments were in branch courts of the First Municipal Division, where he handled felonies and misdemeanors, and to Traffic Court at the Daley Center.

Judge Maloney is considered to be exceptionally knowledgeable about his area of the law, and has good legal ability. He has a good temperament. He is described as calm, slow to anger, and respectful to the parties before him. He is praised for his courtroom management skills. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Marcia Maras** was appointed to the bench in 1999. Prior to becoming a judge, Marcia Maras was in private practice. She also served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney and as General Counsel to the Cook County Assessor. Judge Maras was appointed in 1999 and elected to the Circuit Court in 2000. Judge Maras has been in the Law Division since 2006. From 1999 to 2006, she was in the County Division hearing adoption, election, mental health, and real estate tax matters. Prior to her judicial appointment, she was Chief Deputy of the Cook County Assessor's Office for five years. Her duties there included oversight of the General Counsel Division and supervision of all litigation. Before that, she was Assistant General Counsel in the Assessor's Office, a law firm associate, an Assistant State's Attorney in the Real Estate Tax Unit, and a law clerk to an Illinois Appellate Court Justice.

Judge Maras is considered to be a very good jurist with good legal ability and temperament. She handles a difficult call efficiently and with a professional manner. She understands the issues and rules decisively. She is considered to have good legal ability with an excellent temperament. Judge Maras was praised by all respondents as having a good knowledge of procedure and substantive law. She is particularly praised for her courtroom management skills. She presides over a call with complex matters. She takes time to allow counsel to speak and makes a record. She is well prepared. She reads and understands all of the pleadings and

takes the time to do independent research, if necessary. The Council finds her Well Qualified for the Circuit Court.

**Judge Lisa Ann Marino** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1988. Prior to becoming a judge, she was a sole practitioner focusing on real estate and zoning issues. From 1993 to 1997, she was an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney in the civil division, real estate tax unit. From 1988 to 1993 she was an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney where she conducted more than 200 misdemeanor bench trials and traffic offenses, and handled felony financial crime cases. She was elected to the bench in 2012. Since 2016, she has been assigned to the Circuit Court of Cook County's Housing Section of the First Municipal Court as well as the Mortgage Foreclosure Section of the Chancery Court. She had also served in the Mortgage Foreclosure Section from 2013 to 2014 and in the Juvenile Justice Division from 2014 to 2016.

Judge Marino is reported to have good court management skills. She runs an efficient court call and is reported to be respectful and fair to all parties. She is especially praised for her dealings with litigants unrepresented by counsel. She is knowledgeable about her area of law and is described often as being thorough and well prepared. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Jill C. Marisie** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1990. Prior to becoming a judge, Jill Cerone-Marisie worked as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney as well as in private practice. Judge Cerone-Marisie was elected to the Circuit Court in 2006. Since September 2017, she has served as Acting Presiding Judge of the Third Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Rolling Meadows, Illinois. Since 2015, she has also presided over the Third District's Veteran Court, Mental Health Court Probation, and expungements. Her other assignments in the Third District have included bond hearings, preliminary hearings, warrants, misdemeanor criminal calls, trials, motions, and violations of probation (2011-2017) and misdemeanor cases (2007-2011). Prior to that, she was assigned to the First District (2006-2007), where she heard traffic cases.

Judge Marisie is considered to have good legal ability. She is knowledgeable and is praised for the thoroughness and accuracy of her opinions. She handles problem solving courts such as the Veterans Court and the Mental Health Court call. While she has been the Presiding Judge for only a short period of time, she is considered to be doing a good job. As a judge she is considered to be fair and patient on the bench and is reported to have good courtroom management skills. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Diann K. Marsalek** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1990. She spent 16 years in the Illinois Attorney General's office doing litigation primarily for the Illinois Department of Corrections (DOC). Her initial 13 years in practice were primarily spent defending Section 1983 cases against the DOC in federal court, though she did also have some limited litigation experience in state court during this period. Her final three years in the AG's office were spent as a "facilitator" for litigation involving the DOC and as a policy advisor concerning litigation and legislation. She was elected to the bench in 2012. She is Supervising Judge in the Traffic Section of the First Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Her

other assignments in the First District have included Post Judgment Collections, eviction, and, from 2011 to 2013, traffic court.

Judge Marsalek is considered to have good courtroom management skills who is fair and respectful to all parties. She is reported to be exceptionally knowledgeable about her area of law, and is reported to be well prepared. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Margaret Stanton McBride** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1976. Prior to becoming a judge, she serves as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. Since 1998, she has served on the Appellate Court of Illinois, First District. Since 2015, she has been assigned to the Court's Fourth Division. She also serves as a member of the Court's Executive Committee, as an Elected Appellate Court Member of the Illinois Courts Commission (2007-present), and as a member of the Illinois Supreme Court's Judicial Performance Evaluation Committee (2011-present), Rules Committee (2012-present), and Access to Justice Commission (2015-present). Her previous judicial assignments were in the Circuit Court of Cook County, as Presiding Judge, Third Municipal District (1997-1998), the Chancery Division (1994-1997), the Law Division (1992-1994), the Criminal Division (1990-1992), and the First Municipal District (1987-1990).

Judge McBride is reported to have an excellent grasp on law and facts of each case which comes before her. She is always well prepared for oral argument, and is an active participant. She is praised for the quality and the timeliness of her opinions. She is also very involved in activities around improving the quality of the court system. The Council finds her Well Qualified for retention to the Appellate Court.

**Judge James Michael McGing** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1986. Prior to becoming a judge, James McGing was in private practice. He also served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney and as legal counsel to the Sheriff of Cook County. Judge McGing was elected to the Circuit Court in 2006. He is assigned to the Law Division, Tax and Miscellaneous Section of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois (2016-present, 2014-2015). Previously he was assigned to the Law Division Jury Section (2015-2016), the Housing Section (2007-2014), and the Traffic Section (2006-2007).

Judge McGing is considered to have good legal ability and has done well in all of judicial assignments. The Council praised him as an excellent jurist when he last ran for retention in 2012. We continue to see him is a conscientious jurist who is well prepared and is praised for his courtroom management. He is respectful to all who appear before him, and he is reported to issue thorough, thoughtful, and accurate decisions. He has worked for systemic improvements in the court system. The Council finds him Well Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Michael B. McHale** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1991. Prior to becoming a judge, Michael McHale served as a career Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. Judge McHale was elected in 2006. Since 2013, he has been assigned to felony criminal courtrooms in the Circuit Court. His prior assignments included cases involving sexually violent persons (2010-2013) and Domestic Violence Court (2007-2010).

Judge McHale receives high marks for his legal knowledge. He is reported to be well prepared and as a judge makes a good record, and prepares written rulings when deemed necessary. He is considered to have a good temperament, and many respondents note that he is especially patient with those unrepresented by legal counsel. The Council is concerned, however, that we have received reports that Judge McHale can unduly favor the prosecution. Sentencing information the Council has reviewed suggests that he can issue harsh sentences compared to other criminal division judges. However, the Council believes that these reports are offset by other reports that Judge McHale does explore more lenient sentencing options that, for example involve drug or mental health treatment coupled with probation rather than prison. We understand that Judge McHale will provide multiple chances for a defendant to complete probation successfully, and he has sought to reduce the burden that court costs, fines, and fees imposes on defendants following their conviction. On balance, the Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Michael T. Mullen** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1981. Prior to becoming a judge, he was in private practice where he concentrated his law practice on personal injury cases and more specifically on cases that involved catastrophic personal injuries caused by medical negligence and product liability. From 1985 to 1991, he served as an Assistant U.S. Attorney where he was the Deputy Chief of the Criminal Division, and from 1982-1985 he worked as an Assistant Illinois Attorney General. He won election to the bench in 2012. Since 2016, he has been assigned to the Chancery of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois, where he handles cases that include class actions, administrative review actions, and insurance coverage. Previously, he was assigned to the Chancery's Mortgage Foreclosure/Mechanics Lien Section (2013-2016) and to the First Municipal District (2011-2013), where he served in the Traffic Section and the Felony Preliminary Hearing Section.

Respondents in this evaluation think he has good legal ability and temperament. He is praised for issuing well reasoned, thoughtful decisions. He is considered well prepared and is reporting to be doing a good job managing his call. Judge Mullen is sought out by lawyers to help settle cases and he has served as a mentor to other judges. He is praised for putting into place procedures that led to a substantial decrease in the backlog found in the Mortgage Foreclosure Section of the Chancery Division. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge James Patrick Murphy** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1995. Prior to becoming a judge, James Patrick Murphy served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. Judge Murphy was elected to the Circuit Court in 2006. Since 2007, he has been assigned to the Domestic Violence Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois, where he presides over a misdemeanor/felony domestic violence call. He also served as Acting Supervising Judge for court in 2008-2009. His prior judicial assignment was the Traffic Section of the First Municipal Court (2006-2007).

Judge Murphy is considered to have very good legal ability, and is praised for his courtroom management. He balances well the need to keep his court call moving with giving all parties a fair opportunity to be heard. He is reported to be respectful to all those who appear before him. The Council finds him Well Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Thomas William Murphy** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1979. Prior to becoming a judge, Thomas W. Murphy was in private practice and a City of Chicago Alderman. Judge Murphy was elected to the Circuit Court in 2006. He is the Supervising Judge of the Civil Division of the Fifth Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County. Since 2010, he handled civil litigation matters there that include both Law Division and Municipal Division cases. For his previous assignment at the Fifth Municipal District, he heard Misdemeanor and Traffic cases (2008-2009). Prior to that, he was assigned to the First Municipal Court, where he heard traffic and municipal civil cases.

Judge Murphy is considered to have good legal ability. He is respectful to all parties before him, and gives individuals an opportunity to address the court. He is reported to be well prepared for each case and makes sure that each person before him understands what is occurring. Overall, he is praised as a solid jurist. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Joan Margaret O'Brien** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1983. Prior to becoming a judge, Joan Margaret O'Brien was a career prosecutor with the Cook County State's Attorney's Office. Judge O'Brien was elected to the Circuit Court in 2000. Since 2011, she has been a felony trial courtroom judge in the Fifth Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Bridgeview, Illinois. Her previous assignments in the Fifth Municipal District include various criminal and traffic courts, as well as the Drug Treatment and Veterans Treatment Courts (2010-2014). Prior to that, she was assigned to the Child Protection Division in Juvenile Court (2000-2008).

Judge O'Brien is considered to have good legal ability, and is reported to be a solid judge with good temperament and courtroom management skills. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Ramon Ocasio III** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1989. Prior to becoming a judge, Ramon Ocasio III served as an Assistant Cook County Public Defender and as a Supervisor in the Cook County Public Defender's Office. He also worked in the Illinois Attorney General's Regional Consumer Fraud Office in Chicago. Judge Ocasio was elected to the Circuit Court in 2006. Since January 2018, he has presided over a felony courtroom in the Fourth Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Maywood, Illinois. His previous assignments in the Fourth District were to Drug Treatment Court and the preliminary hearing court call (2016-2018) and to misdemeanor/traffic court calls (approximately 2013-2015). Prior to that, he was assigned to Central Bond Court rotation.

Judge Ocasio is considered to have good legal ability and is notably knowledgeable. He has good court management skills, and is praised for explaining court procedures to the litigants before him. He is respectful to all persons before him, and is generally praised as a solid jurist. Judge Ocasio is reported to seek alternatives to incarceration, whenever possible, and is considered to be well organized and always well prepared. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Karen Lynn O'Malley** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1992. Prior to becoming a judge, she was in private practice doing personal injury litigation. From 1992 to 2008, she served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. Between 2003 and 2008, she served as a deputy supervisor in the Child Advocacy Division of the Cook County State's Attorney's Office. She has taught trial practice at Northwestern University School of Law. She was elected to the bench in 2012.

Since 2013, she has been assigned to the Decedent Estates call of the Probate Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Her previous judicial assignments were in the First Municipal Division (2012-2013) and included Traffic Court, misdemeanor and felony Branch Courts, Forcible Detainer Actions, Contract and Tort Actions, and Pre-Trial Motion Call.

Judge O'Malley is considered to have good knowledge of the law and procedures in her current assignment. She served as a faculty liaison for the 2018 Judicial Education Conference where she worked on the curriculum for a course addressing implicit bias. She is reported to be fair to all parties before her. She is praised for being well prepared. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Paul Steven Pavlus** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1993. Prior to becoming a judge, he served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. He was elected to the bench in 2012. Since 2014 he held a dual assignment to the First and Second Municipal Districts of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Skokie, Illinois. He hears traffic, misdemeanor, domestic violence, and felony cases. Prior to his current assignment he worked in preliminary courtrooms throughout the city of Chicago and in traffic court at the Daley Center.

Judge Pavlus is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. He is praised for both being respectful to the parties before him but also being able to move his call efficiently. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Lorna E. Propes** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1975. Before becoming a judge, she was a partner in the firm of Propes & Kaveny LLC. She served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney between 1975 and 1980. She has been in private practice since 1980, concentrating on medical malpractice, product liability, and personal injury litigation. She was appointed to the bench in 2010 and won election to the bench in 2012. Since 2013, she has been assigned to the Law Division, Trial Section of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Previously, she had been assigned to traffic court at the Richard J. Daley Center (2010-2013).

Judge Propes is considered to be an excellent trial judge. She has very good legal ability and is praised for her courtroom management skills. She is respectful to litigants and is reportedly good with jurors. She is exceptionally hard working and conscientious. She enjoys a reputation of being fair to all who appear before her. The Council finds her Well Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Cynthia Ramirez** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1990. Following her admission to the bar, Ms. Ramirez served as an Assistant Cook County Public Defender from 1990 to 1995, left the Office for private practice in 1996 to 1997, and returned to the Public Defender's Office from 1997 to 1998. She has served as an administrative law judge with the Illinois Department of Human Services, and with the Illinois Department of Public Health. She was elected to the bench in 2012. Since 2014, she has been assigned to the Juvenile Justice Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. She was previously assigned to the Domestic Violence Division (2013-2014) and to the First Municipal District (2012-2013), where she presided over traffic matters and rotated through various misdemeanor and preliminary hearing courtrooms.

Judge Ramirez is considered to have good legal ability. She is reported to be knowledgeable about her area of law and to possess a good temperament. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Erica Lorraine Reddick** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1991. She was appointed to the Circuit Court by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2010. Prior to being appointed, Judge Reddick was an Acting Chief Assistant Cook County Public Defender. She has spent her career with the Office of the Cook County Public Defender. She was elected to the bench in 2012. Since 2013, she has been assigned to the Criminal Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois, where she hears felony and post-conviction matters. Previously, she was assigned to the Chicago Traffic Center (2010-2011) and the Child Protection Division.

Judge Reddick is considered to have very good legal ability, and is very involved in judicial education sessions throughout Illinois. She is praised for her courtroom management skills and is respectful for all the parties before her. Her opinions are thoughtful, thorough, and issued in a timely fashion. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Mary Colleen Roberts** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1989. Prior to becoming a judge, Mary Colleen Roberts was a social worker and then served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. She has also served as a hearing officer for the Cook County Circuit Court and an Assistant Corporation Counsel for the City of Chicago in the Law Department. Judge Roberts was elected to the Circuit Court in 2006. Since 2015, she has been assigned to the Domestic Relations Division of the Fourth District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Maywood, Illinois. Her previous assignments were to the Cook County Criminal Court (2010-2015); the Felony Trial Court and the Access to Community Treatment Court (2012-2015), Municipal and Traffic Matters in the Fourth (2008-2010) and the First District Courts (2006-2007), and the Juvenile Justice Division (2007-2008).

Judge Roberts is considered to have very good legal ability. Her rulings are reported to be thoughtful and thorough. She understands the relevant law and is praised for how she applies the law to the facts of the case. She has an excellent temperament and is well respected for her treatment of litigants unrepresented by legal counsel. Judge Roberts has good court management skills and runs her courtroom both efficiently and fairly. Before being assigned to her current call, Judge Roberts helped plan and was the founding judge for the Access to Community Treatment Courtroom 201 at the Leighton Criminal Courts Building, where she

received praise for her problem solving abilities in this community treatment diversion court. The Council finds her Well Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Thomas D. Roti** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1970. Prior to becoming a judge, Thomas David Roti was in private practice, and became General Counsel for Dominick's Finer Foods, Inc. Judge Roti was elected to the Circuit Court in 2000. Prior to becoming a judge, Thomas David Roti was in private practice, and became General Counsel for Dominick's Finer Foods, Inc. Judge Roti was elected to the Circuit Court in 2000. Since 2005, he has been assigned to Jury Trial Call in civil cases in the Third Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Rolling Meadows, Illinois. In addition, he is Supervising Judge of the Third District's Mandatory Arbitration Program. Previously, he was assigned to misdemeanor and traffic cases in the First (2000-2003) and Third Districts (2003-2005), as well as housing and civil cases in the First District (2000-2003).

Judge Roti is considered to have good legal ability. He is praised for his knowledge of the relevant law and for being well prepared. He is respectful to the parties before him, and is reported by all respondents to be fair to all parties. The Council finds him Qualified for retention.

**Judge Beatriz Santiago** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1996. Prior to becoming a judge, she served as an Assistant Cook County Public Defender defending felony cases in the Juvenile Division. For three years she was in private practice doing personal injury litigation. She was elected to the bench in 2012. Since February 2017, she has been assigned to handle traffic and misdemeanor cases in the Third Municipal District of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Rolling Meadows, Illinois. She has also been assigned to Marriage Court (2015-2017), misdemeanor branch courts (2013-2014), and Traffic Court at the Daley Center (2012-2013).

Judge Santiago is considered to have good legal ability and is praised for her temperament and for her courtroom management, and in particular for the way she communicates with defendants who are unrepresented by counsel. The Council is concerned that in 2015, a Judicial Inquiry Board complaint involving misrepresentation in a personal mortgage refinancing matter resulted in her being censured. But in balancing this ethical issue against the generally positive comments the Council has heard about Judge Santiago's judicial performance, the Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Regina Ann Scannicchio** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1989. Prior to becoming a judge, she was in private practice with a focus on family law. She was elected to the bench in 2012. Since 2012, she has been assigned to the Domestic Relations Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Previously she was assigned to the Traffic Division of the First Municipal District (2011-2012).

Judge Scannicchio is considered to have good legal ability. She is praised for her temperament and for always being well prepared. She is considered to be a solid jurist who does a good job of controlling her courtroom, and issuing accurate and timely decisions. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.



**Judge Andrea M. Schleifer** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1979. She was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court in November 2010. Before taking the bench, she was a solo practitioner concentrating in family law matters for most of her career since being admitted to practice in 1979. From 1986 to 1987, she was a partner in the general practice firm of Kaszak & Schleifer. From 1980 to 1981, she was a partner in the general practice firm of Mullane & Schleifer. She was elected to the bench in 2012. Since 2011, she has been assigned to the Domestic Relations Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Previously she was assigned to the Forcible Entry and Detainer section at the Daley Center (2010-2011) and to the Traffic Division of the First Municipal District (2010).

Judge Schleifer is described as a hard working jurist who is concerned about justice. Her temperament is described as being patient and respectful. There are some lawyers who question her application of the law to the facts of the case, but most lawyers say that she has good legal ability and is a solid jurist. She is reported to be doing a good job of managing her courtroom. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Colleen F. Sheehan** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1988. Prior to becoming a judge, Colleen Sheehan served for four years as an Assistant Cook County Public Defender. She also worked as a hearing officer for Chicago's Administrative Hearing Department, and was in private practice. Judge Sheehan was elected to the Circuit Court in 2000. Since 2007, she has been assigned to the Juvenile Justice Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. She also holds an additional assignment at the Restorative Justice Community Court.(August 2017-present). Previously, she was assigned to the Domestic Violence Division. .

Judge Sheehan is considered to have very good legal ability and is reported to do a good job of applying the law to the facts. She is reported to treat every party with respect and with fairness. She has good courtroom management skills and handles difficult and emotional situations in a controlled but compassionate manner. She is widely respected as a judge, and she is praised for her work with the North Lawndale Community Court. She is reported to be extraordinarily concerned about making our court system fair for all persons, and is passionate about the relationship between the well being of the community and the role of the court system. The Council finds her Well Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Diane Moore Shelley** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1984. Prior to becoming a judge, Diane Shelley was in private practice. She also served as a hearing officer for the City of Chicago Department of Revenue. She was the Head Assistant Attorney for the Metropolitan Water Reclamation District of Greater Chicago. Judge Shelley was elected to the Circuit Court in 2006. Since January 2017, she has been assigned to the Law Division, Commercial Calendar Section of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Previously she was assigned to the Law Division, Trial Section (2014-2017); the First Municipal District's Civil Jury Trial Section (2010-2014) and Forcible Entry and Detainer (2008-2010), and the Domestic Violence Court (2006-2008).

Judge Shelley is considered to possess good legal ability and knowledge. She is praised for her temperament, and for being well prepared. She is reported to make timely rulings that are fair to all parties. The Council finds her Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge James Michael Varga** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1978. Prior to becoming a judge, James M. Varga was a supervisor in the Medical Litigation Division of the Cook County State's Attorney's Office, as well as a felony prosecutor. Mr. Varga also spent some time in private practice. Judge Varga was elected to the Circuit Court in 1994. Since 2002, he has been assigned to the Law Division, Trial Section of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. Previously he was assigned to the Law Division's Complex Litigation Case Management Section (1996-2002) and to the First Municipal District, where he heard Preliminary Hearings (1995) and Traffic (1994-1995) matters.

Judge Varga is considered to have good legal ability. He is well prepared and is praised for his courtroom management skills. Lawyers report that he does a good job with complex evidentiary issues, and lawyers say he is fair to all sides. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge Carl Anthony Walker** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1992. Prior to becoming a judge, Carl Anthony Walker was in private practice and worked as an Administrative Hearing Officer for the City of Chicago. Judge Walker was appointed and then elected to the Circuit Court of Cook County in 2006. Judge Walker was appointed to the Illinois Appellate Court in May 2018. Prior to his recent appointment to the Appellate Court, he was assigned to the Law Division – Tax and Miscellaneous Remedies Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County in Chicago, Illinois. In addition, he was previously assigned to the Juvenile Justice Division (2009-2013) and to the First Municipal Division, in various Branch Courts (2009-2009; 2006), in the Forcible Entry and Detainer Section (2006), and Traffic Court (2006).

Judge Walker, as a trial judge, is praised for his legal ability. He prepares written opinions which are described as thorough, thoughtful, and accurate. He is also praised for his conduct in the courtroom and is reported to be fair to all parties. He is always well prepared and has a reputation as a solid, conscientious jurist. Judge Walker has a reputation of showing compassion to those before him, and of being committed to the well being of the community. The Council finds him Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

**Judge E. Kenneth Wright, Jr.** was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1977. Prior to becoming a judge, Kenneth Wright was in private practice as a sole practitioner. He is a former teacher and Associate Dean of the Joliet Junior College. Kenneth Wright was appointed to the Circuit Court in 1994 and elected the same year. He was initially assigned to the Municipal Division and later was transferred to the Probate Division. He presently serves as presiding judge of the First Municipal District.

Presiding Judge Wright is praised generally for his extensive legal knowledge and ability. He is especially noted for his innovations and ideas for new approaches which will allow the courts to be even more fair and effective. His "flex call" is a court call outside of normal business hours

through which pro bono lawyers can provide representation to otherwise unrepresented parties. Some lawyers commented that he focuses on improving the courts which should be one of the jobs of a presiding judge. He is praised for his compassionate and professional demeanor. He is exceptionally hard working. The Council finds him Well Qualified for retention to the Circuit Court.

---

## **Countywide Elections (all ballots)**

### **Vacancy of the Hon. Eileen Mary Brewer**

#### **Kathryn M. Vahey -- Qualified**

Kathryn M. Vahey was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1998. Since that time, she has worked as an Assistant Public Defender in the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where she represents indigent clients charged in felony criminal cases. Since 2000, she has been assigned to the Fifth Municipal District Court in Bridgeview.

Ms. Vahey is considered to be a skilled trial attorney with good legal ability. She is described as having a good temperament, and is described as fair and reasonable. She is reported to be a zealous advocate for her clients. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

### **Vacancy of the Hon. Evelyn B. Clay**

#### **Kathaleen T. Lanahan -- Qualified**

Kathaleen T. Lanahan was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1993. She is a Cook County Assistant State's Attorney, where she is a first chair felony trial assistant, and whose responsibilities include prosecuting homicide cases. Prior to her work at the State's Attorney Office, she was an analyst at the Cook County Board of Real Estate Appeals (1993-1994).

Ms. Lanahan is considered to have good legal ability and has substantial litigation experience across a variety of criminal prosecution matters. She is praised for her trial skills and

for her temperament and honesty as a prosecutor. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Deborah M. Dooling**

##### **Athanasios (Tom) S. Sianis -- Qualified**

Athanasios (Tom) S. Sianis was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2004. Since 2012, he has been Enforcement Division Chief of the Illinois Secretary of State Securities Department, as well as a Special Assistant Attorney General to prosecute fraud cases (2016-present). Previously, he was an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney (2005-2012) and focused on felony, preliminary hearing, domestic violence, and child support enforcement matters.

Mr. Sianis is considered to have good legal ability. He has substantial litigation experience in both bench and jury matters, and is praised for his temperament. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Lynn M. Egan**

##### **Rosa Maria Silva – Qualified**

Rosa Maria Silva was admitted to practice in 2001. She is an Assistant Cook County Public Defender assigned to the Felony Trial Division. From 2001 to 2002 she represented clients in divorce and real estate matters. From 2002 to 2003 she served as an Assistant Will County Public Defender. She is very active in bar association and civic activities. She is reported to have good legal ability and is considered to be a hard-working defense counsel with good temperament. She has substantial litigation experience in more complex matters. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Laurence J. Dunford**

##### **Thomas Francis McQuire – Qualified**

Thomas Francis McQuire was admitted to practice in 2000. Since 2013, he has been a sole practitioner doing primarily criminal defense work. From 2003 to 2013, he served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. From 2001 to 2003, he worked as an attorney with the Office of the Chief Judge assigned to research post conviction petitions. He is considered to have good legal ability and is praised for his knowledge of the law. He has substantial litigation experience in more complex matters both as a State's Attorney and as a private practitioner. Lawyers said he is trustworthy in his dealings with opposing counsel and has a good temperament generally. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Thomas E. Flanagan**

##### **Hon. Preston Jones, Jr. -- Qualified**

Hon. Preston Jones, Jr. was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1994. He was appointed a Circuit Judge by the Illinois Supreme Court in September 2017. Prior to taking the bench, he was an Assistant Public Defender at Cook County Public Defender's Office, where from 2004 to 2017 he was a member of the Homicide Task Force. Before that, he served as an Assistant Public Defender in the Felony Trial Division (1998-2004) and in Juvenile Justice/Child Protection.

Judge Jones is considered to have good legal ability and is praised for his knowledge of the criminal law and for his trial skills. He is reported to have a professional demeanor and was a zealous advocate. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Russell W. Hartigan**

##### **Cecilia A. Horan – Qualified**

Cecilia A. Horan was admitted to the Illinois bar in November, 1997. She is currently a partner at Hinshaw & Culbertson, where she has spent most of her career. Her practice concentrates on tort litigation, including personal injury, premises liability, product liability and insurance claims coverage. Ms. Horan is considered to have good legal ability and has experience with more complex litigation matters. She is praised for her temperament both in court and in dealing with opposing counsel. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Michelle D. Jordan**

##### **Hon. Clare Joyce Quish -- Qualified**

Clare Joyce Quish was admitted to practice in 2000. She was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. She was a Partner with Schuyler Roche & Crisham P.C., serving as litigation counsel in a variety of commercial and civil litigation matters in both state and federal courts. She has also had an appellate practice in both state and federal courts, including the Illinois Appellate Court, the Illinois Supreme Court, and the Seventh Circuit Court of Appeals. She has been a Partner since 2009 and an Associate between 2007 and 2009. From 2000 to 2007 she was a law clerk to Justice Mary Jane Theis when she was an Appellate Court judge. She has served as an adjunct professor at Loyola University Law School, and serves on the Illinois Supreme Court's Committee for Character and Fitness for the First Judicial District.

Ms. Quish is considered to have good legal ability and has litigation experience in more complex matters. She is well respected as a practitioner, and she is reported to have good temperament. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Sheila McGinnis**

##### **Hon. Peter Michael Gonzalez – Not Qualified**

Peter Michael Gonzalez was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1994. He was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. Before taking the bench, he had been a solo practitioner whose main focus is criminal defense, but who also handles matters that include domestic relations, employment, licensing, and immigration. He has also worked as an administrative law judge in the Illinois Department of Employment Security (2003-2013) and as an Assistant Public Defender in the Cook County Public Defender's Office (1994-2003), where his assignments included Juvenile Delinquency, Juvenile Abuse and Neglect, Preliminary Hearings, Night Narcotics, and the Felony Trial Division. Since 2012, he has been a Member of the Lawyer's Auxiliary Board of the Illinois Judges Foundation. In 2005 and 2007, he was disciplined by his employer, the Illinois Department of Employment Security, for discourtesy during hearings he conducted as an administrative law judge.

In 2013, the Council stated that, "Mr. Gonzalez is reported to have good legal ability and his earlier career involved substantial litigation matters. He was praised for his temperament as defense counsel, and is considered to be a good defense lawyer. The Council, however, is concerned about negative reports concerning his current role as an administrative hearing

officer. He is reported to be inappropriately impatient and rude to litigants. He is criticized for the disrespectful manner in which he sometimes treats witnesses. On balance, the Council finds him Not Qualified for the Circuit Court.” Since 2013, Mr. Gonzalez has been a solo practitioner and has received positive marks for his work. But the Council continues to be concerned about Mr. Gonzalez’s temperament. On balance, the Council finds him Not Qualified.

### **Vacancy of the Hon. Jean Prendergast Rooney**

#### **John Joseph Hagerty – Qualified**

John Joseph Hagerty was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1990. He is a Partner at Taft Stettinius and Hollister LLP, where he represents public and privately held companies, various local government units and individuals in civil litigation matters. From 1990 to 1994, he served as an Associate at Phelan, Pope, and John Ltd., where he focused on commercial disputes.

Mr. Hagerty is a widely praised attorney with good legal ability. He has substantial litigation experience in complex matters and is reported to have excellent litigation skills. His temperament is unquestioned and many respondents commented on the respect that he shows to opposing counsel. He is active in community activities. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

### **Subcircuit Elections**

#### **1st Subcircuit**

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Orville E. Hambright, Jr.**

#### **Erika Lynn Orr – Qualified**

Erika Lynn Orr was admitted to practice in 1998. She is a solo practitioner with substantial litigation experience in the family law area. She is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. She is a respected practitioner who is praised for her knowledge of the law in her practice area. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **2nd Subcircuit**

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Bertina E. Lampkin**

#### **Tiana Ellis Blakely – Qualified**

Tiana Ellis Blakely was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2004. Since 2005, she has worked as an Assistant Public Defender in the Cook County Public Defender’s Office, where she is currently a Grade 3 Attorney. In that capacity, she represents clients in cases ranging from battery to first degree murder. Her pro bono work includes participating in the 34th Ward/15th Legislative District Expungement Fair and serving in the Polished Pebbles program, where she speaks to participants about understanding their legal rights.

Ms. Blakely is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. She has substantial litigation experience and is praised for her trial skills. She assists with the defense in murder trials although she is not the lead attorney. Ms. Blakely has only 13 years of experience as an attorney but she has had a variety of legal experiences and is considered a solid defense attorney. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Marjorie C. Laws**

**Hon. Adrienne E. Davis -- Qualified**

Hon. Adrienne E. Davis was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1994. In March 2017, she was appointed a Cook County Circuit Court judge by the Illinois Supreme Court. Since that time, she has presided in the First Municipal District. Previously she had been an Assistant Public Defender at the Cook County Public Defender's Office (1995-2017), where, from 2010 to 2017, she was assigned to the Homicide Task Force. She was the Law Day 2017 Chair of the Cook County Bar Association and the National Legal Counsel to Top Ladies of Distinction from 2016 to 2017.

Judge Davis was well respected as an Assistant Cook County Public Defender with substantial litigation experience in complex matters. She has received positive reviews in her tenure as a Circuit Judge. She is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

**Vacancy of the Hon. James L. Rhodes****Hon. Toya T. Harvey -- Qualified**

Hon. Toya T. Harvey was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1995. She was appointed to the bench as a Circuit Judge by the Illinois Supreme Court in March 2017. From 1996 to 2017, she worked for the Office of the Cook County Public Defender, where since 2013 she was a Grade IV Assistant Public Defender on the Suburban Homicide Task Force. She has provided pro bono services at various expungement summits, including the 2017 County-wide Expungement Summit sponsored by the Clerk of the Court.

As a lawyer, Judge Harvey was considered to be a zealous advocate for her clients and possessed a good temperament. She was a career assistant public defender and had substantial experience with complex criminal law matters. She is reported to have good legal ability. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

**Vacancy of the Hon. John D. Turner, Jr.****Ieshia Eshale Gray -- Qualified**

Ieshia Eshale Gray was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2002. Since 2004, she has worked as an Assistant Public Defender in the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where she is currently a Grade III Felony Attorney. She has also worked as a Coordinator in the Cook County Court, Civil Protection Division (2003-2004). She has provided pro bono services in wills, trusts, and real estate matters at the Chesterfield Community Council Legal Clinic.

Ms. Gray is considered to have good temperament and has substantial litigation experience. She is active in community activities. Many respondents reported that she is a solid criminal defense counsel and praised her for being able to provide good legal representation in the midst of busy, competing cases in different courtrooms. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

**Vacancy of the Hon. Camille E. Willis****Hon. Debra A. Seaton -- Qualified**

Hon. Debra A. Seaton was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1986. She was appointed to the bench as a Circuit Judge by the Illinois Supreme Court in May 2017. Between 2010 and the time of her appointment to the bench, she served as a supervisor at the Legal Resources Division of the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where she also worked from 1988 to 2000. She has also worked as a solo practitioner, focusing on defending death penalty cases (2000-2010); as an Assistant Public Defender in the Kane County Public Defender's Office in Geneva, IL (1987-

1988); and as an Assistant Appellate Public Defender at the Office of the State Appellate Defender, in Mt. Vernon, IL (1986-1987). She has provided pro bono services at the Mandel Legal Aid Clinic at the University of Chicago Law School, and is a participant in the ABA Mock Trials.

Judge. Seaton is considered to have good legal ability. She is reported to be very knowledgeable, and is a zealous but highly ethical practitioner. She has substantial litigation experience in complex matters, and is praised for her trial skills. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Valerie Turner**

##### **Arthur W. Willis -- Qualified**

Arthur W. Willis was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1994. He is an Assistant Public Defender in the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where he represents indigent clients in felony matters.

Mr. Willis is considered to have good legal ability. He is praised by prosecutors, other defense counsel, and judges for the quality of his motion practice, research, and grasp of legal issues. He has a professional demeanor. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **3rd Subcircuit**

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Maureen F. Delehanty**

##### **Kevin Patrick Cunningham – Qualified**

Kevin Patrick Cunningham was admitted in 1992. He is a sole practitioner and a prosecutor for the Village of Oak Lawn. From 1992-1998 he served as an Assistant State's Attorney and from 1998 to 2001 did criminal defense and personal injury litigation for a private firm. As lead trial counsel he reports taking 31 criminal and 2 civil cases to a jury verdict and around 100 to a bench verdict. He has litigated three appellate cases. Mr. Cunningham is reported to have good legal ability and temperament. He is considered to be a skilled practitioner who is hard-working and conscientious. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **4th Subcircuit**

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Thomas M. Davy**

##### **Hon. David R. Navarro –Well Qualified**

Hon. David R. Navarro was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1993. In May 2017 he appointed by the Illinois Supreme Court to the Circuit Court of Cook County. He is currently assigned to Central Bond Court. He served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney from 1993 to 2009. In 2009, he joined the Illinois Attorney General's Office, where he was chief of the Public Integrity Bureau. In 2007 he was appointed a special Assistant U.S. Attorney to work on an investigation involving the Chicago Police Department's Special Operations Section. He is widely praised for his knowledge, his trial skills, and his integrity. He is often described as being fair and honest. He is considered to have excellent legal ability and is praised for his supervisory skills, as well. The Council finds him Well Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. James G. Riley**

##### **Elizabeth Ciaccia-Lezza – Qualified**



Elizabeth Ciaccia-Lezza was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2001. She is an Assistant State's Attorney at the Cook County State's Attorney Office, where since 2012 she has served as a prosecutor in the Sex Crimes Unit. Previously she served in the Felony Domestic Violence Unit (2009-2012), the Felony Trial Courtroom (2009), the Preliminary Hearings Unit (2008-2009), the Felony Review Unit (2006-2008), the Juvenile Justice Bureau-Delinquency Division (2003-2006), the Juvenile Justice Bureau-Child Protection Division (2002-2003) and the Child Support Enforcement Divisions (2001-2002).

Ms. Ciaccia-Lezza is considered to have good legal ability and is praised for having a strong grasp of the evidentiary and procedural rules. She has substantial litigation experience and is reported to have excellent knowledge of her area of law. She is considered to have a good temperament with good working relationships with victims, witnesses, court personnel, and opposing counsel. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

### **5th Subcircuit**

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Patricia Banks**

##### **Hon. H. Yvonne Coleman – Qualified**

Hon. H. Yvonne Coleman was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1988. Since 2017, she has served as a Judge in the Circuit Court of Cook County, where she is currently assigned to the Municipal Department, District 1, Non-Jury Civil Section. Previously, she was a Solo Practitioner with a focus on civil rights and employment law (2010-2017); General Counsel to the Independent Police Review Board of the City of Chicago (2009-2010); Attorney at the Law Office of H. Yvonne Coleman (2004-2009; 1992-1999); Manager and Chief Administrative Law Judge of the Illinois Department of Employment Security, Appeals Division (2003-2004); Chief of the Civil Rights Bureau of the Attorney General of the State of Illinois (1999-2003); Executive Director of the Cook County Bar Association Community Law Project (1989-1994); and Staff Attorney at the National Labor Relations Board, Region 13, Chicago, Illinois (1988-1989). She has served as Executive Director of the Cook County Bar Association and is a member of the Chicago Bar Association, where she was Chair of the Civil Rights Committee and a member of the Judicial Evaluation Committee.

As a lawyer the Council stated:

"Ms. Coleman is considered to have good legal ability with a wide range of legal experience, including litigation in more complex matters. She is praised for her temperament and for her trial skills. She is reported to be a good lawyer who is exceptionally active in community affairs. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court."

As a judge for a short period of time, Judge Coleman has received high marks for her ability to manage a courtroom. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Rickey Jones**

##### **Hon. Marian Emily Perkins – Qualified**

Marian Emily Perkins was admitted to practice in 1987. She was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. She is a sole practitioner doing criminal law and domestic violence cases. She reports being a trial advisor at the University of Chicago Mandel Clinic Intensive Trial Techniques Course. She is a Commissioner on the Illinois Supreme Court Committee on Character and Fitness and a Commissioner on the 2009 State of Illinois Disproportionate Justice Impact Study Commission. She is active in expungement-related pro bono service. Within

the last five years, Ms. Perkins has been lead counsel in more complex jury and bench trials, including a recent three day trial, and bench trials in juvenile and felony trial courtrooms. She has substantial recent experience in more complex litigation matters. Ms. Perkins is reported to have good legal ability and temperament. She is praised for her trial skills as well as for her civic activities. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

### **Vacancy of the Hon. Edward Washington, II**

#### **Hon. Robert F. Harris – Qualified**

Robert F. Harris was admitted to practice in 1991. He was appointed to the Circuit Court by the Illinois Supreme Court. Before taking the bench, he served as the Cook County Public Guardian. Mr Harris is considered to have good legal ability and was reported to be a good administrator. He has substantial litigation experience. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

### **Sixth Subcircuit**

### **Vacancy of the Hon. Gloria Chevere**

#### **Hon. Kent Delgado –Well Qualified**

Hon. Kent Delgado was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1996. Since 2016, he has been an appointed Judge in the Circuit Court of Cook County, Probate Division, where he oversees the creation and management of minor estate guardianships. He was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. As a Judge, he has also presided over traffic cases in Municipal Court. Previously, he was a Solo Practitioner at the Law Office of Kent Delgado (2016); Partner at Delgado and Tiernan, P.C. (2007-2015); and an Assistant State's Attorney in the Cook County State's Attorney Office (1996-2007), where he was assigned to the Appellate, Municipal, and Felony Trial divisions.

As an attorney, the Council found that Mr. Delgado had substantial trial experience in more complex matters. He was respected for his knowledge of the law and for his litigation skills. He was considered to have good legal ability and temperament, and was praised for his willingness to mentor other attorneys. Judge Delgado is considered to be a knowledgeable and capable judge. He is praised for his dealings with pro se litigants. He is widely praised for his ability to manage his probate courtroom and for the sensitivity that he shows to litigants. The Council finds him Well Qualified for the Circuit Court.

### **Vacancy of the Hon. Richard C. Cooke**

#### **Andrea M. Webber -- Qualified**

Andrea M. Webber was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2002. She is an Assistant Public Defender at the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where she currently serves in the Homicide Task Force Division. Previously, she served in the Felony Trial (2004-2014) and Traffic (2003-2004) Divisions. She has also worked for Kumlin and Fromm (2002-2003), where she handled personal injury and workers' compensation cases. She volunteers for Lawyers in the Classrooms, and in 2008 served as a judicial evaluations investigator for the Puerto Rican Bar Association.

Ms. Webber is considered to have good legal ability. She has substantial experience in complex matters and is praised as a solid practitioner with good trial skills. She is reported to have a good temperament and is considered exceptionally hard working. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## **Vacancy of the Hon. Robert Lopez Cepero**

### **Linda Perez – Qualified**

Linda Perez was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2001. Since 2002, she has worked at the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where her current title is Assistant Public Defender III. She has held positions in the Felony Trial Division (2013-2018), the Juvenile Justice Division (2012-2013, 2004), the Misdemeanor Division (2005-2012), and the Civil Child Protection Division (2002-2004).

Ms. Perez is considered to have good legal ability and has a professional demeanor. She has had a variety of experiences as an Assistant Public Defender and has defended more complex matters as part of her assignment to the Felony Trial Division for the past five years. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## **8th Subcircuit**

## **Vacancy of the Hon. Candace J. Fabri**

### **James A. Shapiro -- Qualified**

James A. Shapiro was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1985. He is a solo practitioner who focuses on federal and state criminal defense matters, and occasionally on civil litigation. He has worked on similar matters as an associate or partner for a number of private law firms (1996-2007; 1985-1989). He has also been a Circuit Court Judge assigned to the Maywood court (2007-2012), and an Assistant U.S. Attorney at the U.S. Attorney's Office (1989-1995). He is a past president of the Decalogue Society of Lawyers (2007-2008), and has chaired several committees for the Chicago Bar Association. He has provided pro bono services for a number of organizations, including Amicus Poloniae (a CVLS-affiliated group, 2013-present) and the Center for Disability and Elder Law (1996-2006).

Judge Shapiro has been found Qualified for the Circuit Court by the Council in past evaluations. As a practitioner, he has had substantial litigation experience in both civil and criminal law matters, and in both trial and appellate court matters. He received praise from practitioners for his legal ability and for his diligence both as a practitioner and as a judge. He is also reported to have a professional demeanor in both capacities. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## **Vacancy of the Hon. Laura C. Liu**

### **Lindsay Christopher Huger -- Qualified**

Lindsay Christopher Huger was admitted to practice in 1989. He is a career public defender with the Cook County Public Defender's Office. He currently serves in the Appeals, Post-Convictions, and Legal Resources section, but has served as a trial attorney, defending complex criminal actions.

Mr. Huger is considered to have good legal ability and is praised for his knowledge of the law. He is reported to be both a good trial and appellate attorney. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## **Vacancy of the Hon. Sheryl A. Pethers**

### **Hon. Jeanne Marie Wrenn -- Qualified**

Jeanne Marie Wrenn was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2003. She was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. Before taking the bench, she served as an Ethics Officer and EEO Officer for Pace. She has been there since 2012. She implements ethics training, internal investigations and advises clients on Illinois' revolving door law. Before that she worked as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney where she prosecuted felon narcotics cases, and was then assigned to be the Legislative Liaison to the Illinois General Assembly.

Ms. Wrenn has bench and jury trial experience in less complex matters, but her work in the legislative arena and her current work as an Ethics Officer require detailed analysis and advocacy involving complex matters. She is praised for her work both as a prosecutor and a legislative analyst. She is reported to have very good legal ability and temperament. The Council balances relatively limited litigation experience against other experiences that demonstrate strong analytic thinking. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

### **10th Subcircuit**

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Eileen O'Neill Burke**

##### **Hon. Stephanie D. Saltouros -- Qualified**

Hon. Stephanie D. Saltouros was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1996. In September 2016 the Illinois Supreme Court appointed her as a Circuit Judge. She is currently assigned to the First Municipal District in Cook County Circuit Court. Previously, she was a solo practitioner with a practice focused on criminal defense (2008-2016), and an Assistant Attorney in the Cook County State's Attorney Office (1996-2008), where she prosecuted criminal and traffic cases. She is a member of the Pensions and Benefits Committee of the Illinois Judges Association.

Judge Saltouros is considered to have good legal ability. Respondents praised her as a prosecutor, a criminal defense practitioner, and as a judge. She is reported to have a professional demeanor. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Donald J. Suriano**

##### **Colleen Daly -- Qualified**

Colleen Daly Colleen Daly was admitted to practice in 1996. She is currently a sole practitioner and reports that she concentrates in criminal defense, juvenile law (both child protection matters and delinquency cases), traffic, appellate work, and some domestic relations. She represents police officers in administrative proceedings. She has been a sole practitioner since January 2010, although she had a partner for part of the time. From 1996 through 2009 she served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. Her assignments included the juvenile division, and the felony trial division. She served as a first chair prosecutor. She has substantial litigation experience in more complex jury and bench trials. In the last three years, Ms. Daly reports that she has represented police officers in administrative, evidentiary hearings. She has also been appointed to be a Guardian Ad Litem in cases involving minors. Ms. Daly also reported a federal court litigation practice, including litigation claiming racial discrimination and cases involving criminal extortion.

Ms. Daly is reported generally to have good legal ability and knowledge of the law. She is praised for her trial skills, and for being knowledgeable and always well-prepared. She is described by opposing counsel as professional and diligent in following through on such items as discovery requests. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

### **11th Subcircuit**

## **Vacancy of the Hon. Kathleen G. Kennedy**

### **Hon. Joanne F. Rosado -- Qualified**

Joanne F. Rosado was admitted to practice in 2001. She was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2017. She is a career Assistant Cook County Public Defender. She is a First Chair Public Defender in murder cases, assigned to the Multiple Defendants Unit. She has substantial litigation experience in more complex matters in both civil and criminal law cases, having been assigned to the section doing child protection cases. Ms. Rosado is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. She is praised for her litigation skills and for being a strong advocate while maintaining a professional demeanor. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## **12th Subcircuit**

### **Vacancy of the Hon. William O. Maki**

#### **David Lawrence Studenroth -- Qualified**

David Lawrence Studenroth was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1987. In 1987 he became an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. In 1998 he began a solo practice focusing on criminal defense matters.

Mr. Studenroth is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. He has litigation experience and is reported to be a solid practitioner. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Joel Chupack -- Qualified**

Joel Chupack was admitted to practice in 1982. He is a partner in the private practice firm of Heinrich & Kramer P.C, with an emphasis in real estate related litigation, including foreclosure, tax deed, eviction, building court, mechanics' liens, chancery actions, and probate. He has presided over 200 arbitrations as a member of the Commercial Panel of the American Arbitration Association. He reports having an active litigation practice. From 1986 to 1990 he was a litigation associate with McBride Baker & Coles. Mr. Chupak is active in Bar Association activities and has worked on real estate related legislation as a member of the ISBA Real Estate Section Council. He is considered to have good legal ability and is reported to be very knowledgeable about his areas of practice. He has a good temperament and is hard-working. He is praised for his work as an arbitrator. He has litigation experience. In general, Mr. Chupack is considered to be a good lawyer. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## **13th Subcircuit**

### **Vacancy of the Hon. Clayton J. Crane**

#### **Gary W. Seyring -- Qualified**

Gary W. Seyring was admitted to practice in 1978. He is also a Certified Public Accountant. He is a solo practitioner focusing on domestic relations, real estate, estate planning, tax planning, and business law. A substantial percentage of Mr. Seyring's practice involves litigation. He is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Ketki Shroff Steffen -- Qualified**

Ketki Shroff Steffen was admitted to practice in 1991. She was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2015 and served until December 2016. She was a career Assistant State's Attorney for Cook County. She reports being lead counsel in 30 trials that have gone to a jury verdict and over 500 that have gone to a bench verdict. She has litigated 13 cases on appeal. Ms. Steffen is reported to have good legal ability and temperament. She enjoys a reputation as a trusted and experienced criminal law litigator. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Jeffrey Lawrence**

##### **Daniel P. Fitzgerald – Qualified**

Daniel P. Fitzgerald was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1991. Since 2005, he has worked as a litigation attorney for the Walgreen Company, where he currently serves as Senior Counsel. He focuses on health care litigation but has also handled employment law and environmental law cases. Previously, he was Chief Legal Counsel and Chief of the Bureau of Administrative Litigation of the Office of the Inspector General, Illinois Department of Health Care and Family Services (2002-2005); General Counsel to the Illinois Racing Board (1999-2002); Assistant State's Attorney in the Illinois Attorney General's Office (1993-1999); and Judicial Law Clerk in the Cook County Circuit Court, Chancery Division (1991-1993).

Mr. Fitzgerald is considered to have good legal ability with a wide range of litigation and other legal experience. He has handled complex litigation on his own and as a supervisor of outside counsel. His is reported to possess a good temperament. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

##### **Shannon P. O'Malley – Not Recommended**

Shannon P. O'Malley did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds her Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Ann O'Donnell**

##### **Alice Christine Svenson – Qualified**

Alice Christine Svenson was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1995. She is the Principal at Svenson Law Offices, where she focuses on family law, federal and state election law, and employment law. Previously, she handled workers compensation cases at Stone and Johnson (Associate and Partner, 1998-2008) and at Ridge and Downes (Associate, 1995-1998). She has participated in several bar associations including the Republican National Lawyers Association, where she served on the Board of Governors and as the Finance Chair and the Illinois State Chapter Chair. She has provided pro bono legal services to divorced fathers through the organization Fathers Helping Fathers.

Ms. Svenson has a variety of legal experiences, including litigation experience in workers compensation cases and domestic relations matters. She has relatively little recent trial experience, although she maintains a motion practice. Respondents say she has demonstrative good litigation skills and she is reported to have a good temperament. There have been a few client complaints concerning her diligence, but on balance, she appears to be a good practitioner. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

##### **Hon. Samuel J. Betar III – Qualified**

Hon. Samuel J. Betar, III was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1983. Since 2012, he has served as an Associate Judge assigned to the Third Municipal District, where he handles traffic, criminal,

domestic violence, housing, civil and parentage matters. He was appointed as a Circuit Judge by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2017. His previous assignments include Domestic Relations, Third Municipal District (2003-2012), Post Judgment Collections, First Municipal District (1999-2003), and First Municipal District, Housing Court (1999). He was also an Associate at Arnold and Kadjan, where he handled labor law and litigation (1991-1998); an Associate at Kamensky and Rubinstein, where he handled commercial litigation (1986-1991), and an Associate at the Botti Law Firm (1983-1986). He is a member of several bar associations, including the Northwest Suburban bar association, where he has Co-Chaired the Matrimonial Law Committee.

Lawyers appearing before Judge Betar consider him to have good legal ability and to have good temperament. He is praised for his ability to manage a large call and for his patience and communication skills with litigants and lawyers. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **14th Subcircuit**

##### **Vacancy of the Hon. Rodolfo Garcia**

###### **Beatriz A. Frausto-Sandoval – Not Qualified**

Beatriz A. Frausto-Sandoval was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2005. Since 2011, she has been a Solo Practitioner at the Law Office of Beatriz A. Frausto-Sandoval, where she focuses on immigration law and related matters. She has also worked as a full-time Contract Attorney at Hudson Legal (2011-2012), where she handled document review in contract litigation cases and an Associate with a focus on immigration law at both Hughes Socol Piers Resnik and Dym, Ltd. (2006-2011) and the Law Office of Scott. E. Bellgrau in Bensenville, IL (2005-2006).

Ms. Frausto-Sandoval specializes in immigration law and is praised for her knowledge of that area of law. She is reported to have good temperament. The Council is concerned, however, with the depth and breadth of her practice. She has been a lawyer since 2005 and focuses almost exclusively on immigration work, which does not include state court practice. The Council finds her Not Qualified for the Circuit Court of Cook County.

#### **15th Subcircuit**

##### **Vacancy of the Hon. George Scully, Jr.**

###### **Michael Brendan Barrett -- Qualified**

Michael Brendan Barrett was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1991. Since 1992, he has worked for Barrett & Sramek, where he is a partner focusing on personal injury, probate and estate planning, and worker's compensation cases. He previously worked as an associate at Moss & Hillison (1991-1992). Mr. Barrett provides pro bono legal services to not-for-profit youth sports organizations, including Vikings Youth Hockey, Amateur Hockey Association of Illinois, Illinois Hockey Officials' Association, and Chicago Fury Youth Hockey. He has held bar association offices and committee memberships including president of the Southwest Bar Association; judicial evaluations investigator and member of the Tort Law Section Council for the Illinois Bar Association; judicial evaluations investigator for the Chicago Bar Association; and vice chairman of the Judicial Screening Committee for the Coalition of Suburban Bar Associations.

Mr. Barrett is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. He is knowledgeable and is reported to have good trial skills. He has substantial litigation experience is well-respected as a practitioner. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Vacancy of the Hon. Frank G. Zelezinski**

##### **Karla Marie Fiaoni—Qualified**

Karla Marie Fiaoni was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1989. Since 2001, she has been the Sole Practitioner and Owner of the Law Office of Karla Marie Fiaoni in Homewood, IL. Her legal practice is focused on criminal defense, family law, and Secretary of State Administration hearings. She has previously served as an Assistant State's Attorney in the Cook County State's Attorney Office (1989-1994), the Chief of Police of the City of Chicago Heights, IL (1994-1996), and Project Director of the Domestic Violence Unit of the City of Chicago Heights. She is a Member and Past President of two bar associations: the Women's Criminal Defense Bar Association and the South Suburban Bar Association.

Ms. Fiaoni is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. She has a variety of legal experiences. She is respected as a solid lawyer who cares about her clients and who is a zealous advocate for them. Ms. Fiaoni has a range of experience which translates well into what is needed for her to be a good judge. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

##### **Scott Darrell McKenna -- Qualified**

Scott Darrell McKenna was admitted to practice in 1996. Mr. McKenna is currently a partner at Best, Vanderlaan & Harrington. He is the principal trial attorney for a caseload of approximately 175 civil cases. He also is responsible for interviewing and hiring attorneys, mentoring attorneys, reviewing client bills and management of the firm. From 1997 to 2000, Mr. McKenna was an associate at Richard B. Bogich & Associates (now known as Winters Salzetta O'Brien & Richardson). He handled plaintiff personal injury matters at both the trial and appellate levels. Mr. McKenna is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. His career includes law firm management and extensive experience as a litigator in civil matters. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.