# Chicago Council of Lawyers Report on Judicial Candidates in the March 20, 2018 Primary For Vacancies on the Appellate Court, First District, Countywide Vacancies on the Circuit Court of Cook County, and Subcircuit Vacancies on the Circuit Court of Cook County (Candidates listed in ballot order)

# February 2018

Primary elections for state-court judges will be held on March 20, 2018. To assist the public in evaluating the candidates for judicial office, the Chicago Council of Lawyers has evaluated candidates for vacancies in Cook County.

Attached is the Council's report of its evaluations of candidates for Cook County countywide vacancies, and for vacancies in the judicial subcircuits of the Circuit Court of Cook County.

#### **INTRODUCTION**

Judicial candidates seeking election must run for specific vacancies. Candidates seeking election to the Circuit Court – which is the County's trial-level court for both civil and criminal matters -- may run in either a countywide or a subcircuit race. Legislation creating the subcircuits provides that approximately one-third of the judges are elected by voters of the entire County, and each of the remaining judges elected by voters runs in one of fifteen geographical districts into which the County has been arbitrarily divided. Once elected, there is no distinction between a "countywide" judge and a "subcircuit" judge. Either kind can be assigned to any judicial post in the County.

The Council rates candidates as "highly qualified," "well qualified," "qualified," or "not qualified." If a candidate refuses to submit his or her credentials to the Council, that candidate is rated "not recommended" unless the Council is aware of credible information that would justify a "not qualified" rating. Because we believe a willingness to participate in bar association and other public evaluations is a key indicator of fitness for public office, no candidate who refuses to be screened can be found "qualified."

#### EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The criteria for the Council's evaluations are whether the candidate has demonstrated the ability to serve on the relevant court in the following categories:

- •fairness, including sensitivity to diversity and bias
- •legal knowledge and skills (competence)
- •integrity
- •experience
- •diligence

- •impartiality
- •judicial temperament
- •respect for the rule of law
- •independence from political and institutional influences
- •professional conduct
- •character
- •community service

If a candidate has demonstrated the ability to perform the work required of a judge in all of these areas, the Council assigns a rating of "qualified." If a candidate has demonstrated excellence in most of these areas, the Council assigns a rating of "well qualified." If a candidate has demonstrated excellence in all of these areas, the Council assigns a rating of "highly qualified." If a candidate has not demonstrated that he or she meets all of the criteria evaluated by the Council, the Council assigns a rating of "not qualified."

We apply higher standards to candidates for the Supreme Court and the Appellate Court. Because these Courts establish legal precedents that bind the lower courts, their work has a broad impact on the justice system. Moreover, qualities of scholarship and writing ability are more important to the work of the Supreme and Appellate Court justices than they are to satisfactory performance as a trial judge.

The Council does *not* evaluate candidates based on their substantive views of political or social issues. Nor do we take into account the particular race in which a candidate is running or the candidates against whom a candidate is running. We apply a uniform standard for all countywide and subcircuit elections because judges elected through either method can be assigned to any judicial position in the Circuit Court.

As part of the evaluation process, we require candidates to provide us with detailed information about their backgrounds, including any complaints filed against them with the Attorney Registration and Disciplinary Commission ("ARDC") or, where applicable, the Judicial Inquiry Board ("JIB"). If a candidate does not participate in our evaluation process, we are unable to obtain that information. Therefore, we assign those candidates a rating of "not recommended."

In conducting these evaluations, the Council has participated in a joint investigation and interview process with the Alliance of Bar Associations for Judicial Screening ("Alliance"). The Alliance includes the following bar associations: Asian American Bar Association, Black Women Lawyers Association, Chicago Council of Lawyers, Cook County Bar Association, Decalogue Society of Lawyers, Hellenic Bar Association, Hispanic Lawyers' Association of Illinois, Illinois State Bar Association, Lesbian and Gay Bar Association of Chicago, Puerto Rican Bar Association, and the Women's Bar Association of Illinois. The Council's evaluation process includes:

(1) a review of a written informational questionnaire provided to the Alliance by the candidate, including details of the candidate's career and professional development and information on any complaints filed against the candidate with the JIB or the ARDC;

(2) a review of the candidate's written responses to the Alliance's supplemental essay questionnaire;

(3) interviews of judges, attorneys, and others with personal knowledge about the candidate, including those who have and those who have not been referred to the Alliance by the candidate, and not restricted to Council members;

(4) a review of the candidate's professional written work, where available;

(5) an interview of the candidate done jointly with the Alliance;

(6) review of any information concerning the candidate provided by the ARDC;

(7) a review of any other information available from public records, such as the Board of Election Commissioners and prosecutorial agencies; and

(8) an evaluation of all the above materials by the Council's Judicial Evaluation Committee; and

(9) submission of the proposed evaluation and write-up to the candidate prior to its public release, to provide an opportunity for comment, correction, or reconsideration.

When the candidate is a sitting judge, the Council places special importance on interviews with attorneys who practice before the judge, particularly those who were not referred to the Council by the candidate. Most evaluations are based on information gathered and interviews held during the past few months. In cases where the Alliance evaluated candidates within the past five years, the Alliance requested updated information, but did not investigate or interview candidates again for the March 2018 primary, instead relying on the earlier results.

In evaluating candidates, the Council expresses written reasons for its conclusions, while abiding by promises to protect the confidentiality of its non-public sources. Without knowing the reason for a recommendation concerning a candidate, the public cannot use the bar's evaluations intelligently to draw its own conclusions.

It should be noted that a lawyer might be performing well or even very well without being qualified to be a judge. A good lawyer may be unqualified to be a judge, for instance, because of a narrow range of prior experience, limited trial experience, or limited work doing legal research and writing. A lawyer may have the temperament and intelligence to be a judge without yet having worked in a position that would allow the candidate to demonstrate that capacity. Similarly, a candidate may have an outstanding resume but lack the temperament or patience to perform well as an even-handed or respectful judge. Accordingly, it should be recognized and expected that we will rate some good lawyers "not qualified."

# **Countywide Elections (all ballots)**

# Vacancy of the Hon. Eileen Mary Brewer

#### Hon. Oran Fresno Whiting -- Qualified

Hon. Oran Fresno Whiting was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1987. He was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. Mr. Whiting served as a commissioner at the Illinois Court of Claims from 1997-2006. Additionally, he was a hearing officer with the Illinois Secretary of State from 2005 to 2006. He has practiced law at a number of private firms. Mr. Whiting was a partner at Gonzales, Saggio and Harlan LLC, where he focused on general litigation and regulatory/government affairs.

Judge Whiting was considered to be a generally good practitioner with a good temperament. He was praised for his work with the Illinois Court of Claims. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Kathryn M. Vahey -- Qualified

Kathryn M. Vahey was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1998. Since that time, she has worked as an Assistant Public Defender in the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where she represents indigent clients charged in felony criminal cases. Since 2000, she has been assigned to the Fifth Municipal District Court in Bridgeview.

Ms. Vahey is considered to be a skilled trial attorney with good legal ability. She is described as having a good temperament, and is described as fair and reasonable. She is reported to be a zealous advocated for her clients. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### John G. Maher -- Qualified

John G. Maher was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1993. He is a deputy supervisor of the Gang Crimes Unit at the Cook County State's Attorney's Office. His other positions at the State's Attorney's Office have included deputy supervisor of the Auto Theft Unit (2015-2017), first chair in the Gang Crimes Unit (2002-2015), and Assistant State's Attorney (1993-1999). He has also worked as an associate attorney at the law firm of Day and Robert (2001-2002) and a contract attorney at Sprint PCS (1999-2001).

Mr. Maher is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. He has a wealth of litigation experience in more complex matters and is praised for his trial skills. He is reported to be cooperative with defense counsel, and is considered to be a source of knowledge for other attorneys. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Evelyn B. Clay

#### Kathaleen T. Lanahan -- Qualified

Kathaleen T. Lanahan was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1993. She is a Cook County Assistant State's Attorney, where she is a first chair felony trial assistant, and whose responsibilities include prosecuting homicide cases. Prior to her work at the State's Attorney Office, she was an analyst at the Cook County Board of Real Estate Appeals (1993-1994).

Ms. Lanahan is considered to have good legal ability and has substantial litigation experience across a variety of criminal prosecution matters. She is praised for her trial skills and

for her temperament and honesty as a prosecutor. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## Jonathan C. Green -- Qualified

Jonathan C. Green was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1986. He is senior counsel/supervisor of the Department of Law at the City of Chicago, Federal Civil Rights Litigation Division, where is responsible for all aspects of civil rights and torts legislation. From 2003 to 2013, he worked as a principal of the Law Offices of Green and Green, P.C., and of counsel at Rock, Fusco & Garvey Ltd. At both firms his practice included domestic and international civil litigation, including business and construction litigation, real estate and commercial transactions, and international law.

Mr. Green is viewed by many respondents as knowledgeable about substantive and procedural law with good legal ability. To these lawyers, he is a solid practitioner. Most respondents report that he has a good temperament. In general, he has had an impressive legal career with substantial litigation experience in more complex matters. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Michael O'Malley -- Qualified

Michael O'Malley was admitted to practice in 2005. He serves as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney in the Civil Bureau. From 2013 to 2015 he was in the Special Prosecutions Bureau. He has worked in the Criminal Prosecutions Bureau and in the Child Support Unit. He is considered to have good legal ability. He is reported to have a good knowledge of the laws and has substantial litigation-related experience. He is praised for his temperament and for his litigation skills. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

### Lori Ann Roper – Qualified

Lori Ann Roper was admitted to practice in 1994. She is a career Assistant Cook County Public Defender. She is assigned to 26th and California where she is an Attorney Supervisor. She has held various positions as an Assistant Public Defender. Ms. Roper has substantial litigation experience in a variety of complex criminal law matters. She advises other Assistant Public Defenders on litigation strategies, and is considered to be an excellent lawyer. She is reported to have a professional and low key temperament. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Deborah M. Dooling

## Athanasios (Tom) S. Sianis -- Qualified

Athanasios (Tom) S. Sianis was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2004. Since 2012, he has been Enforcement Division Chief of the Illinois Secretary of State Securities Department, as well as a Special Assistant Attorney General to prosecute fraud cases (2016-present). Previously, he was an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney (2005-2012) and focused on felony, preliminary hearing, domestic violence, and child support enforcement matters.

Mr. Sianis is considered to have good legal ability. He has substantial litigation experience in both bench and jury matters, and is praised for his temperament. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# **Timothy John Leeming – Qualified**

Timothy John Leeming was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1986. Since 1988, he has worked as an Assistant Public Defender in the Cook County Public Defender's Office. For the past ten years he has served in the Office's Legal Resources Division, where he handle s specialized exoneration, post-conviction cases. Before that, he held positions in the Felony Trial Division (1995-1998) and the Appeals Division (1988-1995; 1998-2005). From 1986 to 1988 he worked at the civil private practice firms of Levenfield, Gallagher, and Gold and Eugene Pincham, Jr. and Associates.

Mr. Leeming is considered to have good legal ability. He has substantial litigation experience in complex matters and is reported to be a solid defense attorney with good temperament. He is praised for his knowledge of the criminal law. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# **Corri Diane Fetman – Not Recommended**

Ms. Fetman did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds her Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Lynn M. Egan

# Rosa Maria Silva – Qualified

Rosa Maria Silva was admitted to practice in 2001. She is an Assistant Cook County Public Defender assigned to the Felony Trial Division. From 2001 to 2002 she represented clients in divorce and real estate matters. From 2002 to 2003 she served as an Assistant Will County Public Defender. She is very active in bar association and civic activities. She is reported to have good legal ability and is considered to be a hard-working defense counsel with good temperament. She has substantial litigation experience in more complex matters. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Laurence J. Dunford

# **Thomas Francis McQuire – Qualified**

Thomas Francis McGuire was admitted to practice in 2000. Since 2013, he has been a sole practitioner doing primarily criminal defense work. From 2003 to 2013, he served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. From 2001 to 2003, he worked as an attorney with the Office of the Chief Judge assigned to research post conviction petitions. He is considered to have good legal ability and is praised for his knowledge of the law. He has substantial litigation experience in more complex matters both as a State's Attorney and as a private practitioner. Lawyers said he is trustworthy in his dealings with opposing counsel and has a good temperament generally. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Thomas E. Flanagan

# Amanda Moira Pillsbury – Not Qualified

Amanda Moira Pillsbury was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2004. Since 2005, she has worked as an Assistant State's Attorney in the Cook County State's Attorney Office, where she currently serves in the Felony Trial Division at the Leighton Criminal Court building. Her previous assignments there included the Felony Trial Division Skokie Courthouse; the Branch 66 Homicide and Sex Crimes Unit; the Grand Jury Unit; the Preliminary Hearings Unit; and the Felony Review Unit.

Ms. Pillsbury is considered to have good legal ability. Most respondents praised her temperament but a few noted that she can, on occasion, be abrasive with opposing counsel. She has substantial litigation experience although some respondents noted that a substantial amount of her experience has been in less complex matters. Most respondents praised her trial skills, although there were a few respondents who questioned her diligence. Most respondents praised her as a prosecutor. On balance, the Council finds her Not Qualified for the Circuit Court at this time.

#### Hon. Preston Jones, Jr. -- Qualified

Hon. Preston Jones, Jr. was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1994. He was appointed a Circuit Judge by the Illinois Supreme Court in September 2017. Prior to taking the bench, he was an Assistant Public Defender at Cook County Public Defender's Office, where from 2004 to 2017 he was a member of the Homicide Task Force. Before that, he served as an Assistant Public Defender in the Felony Trial Division (1998-2004) and in Juvenile Justice/Child Protection.

Judge Jones is considered to have good legal ability and is praised for his knowledge of the criminal law and for his trial skills. He is reported to have a professional demeanor and was a zealous advocate. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Keely Patricia Hillison – Qualified

Keely Patricia Hillison was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1985. She is a Partner in the law firm of Parrillo Weiss LLP, where she handles civil litigation and appeals, working primarily on personal injury and insurance matters. She previously worked as an Associate for two law firms: Sidney L. Berger (1987-1989), where she handled civil litigation, appeals, and bankruptcy matters, and William L. Needler and Associates (1985-1986), where she handled bankruptcy matters.

Ms. Hillison is considered to have good legal ability. She is praised for her knowledge of the law in her field, and for her temperament. She has substantial litigation experience and is praised for her litigation skills. The Council notes that Ms. Hillison was involved earlier in her career in litigation matters where her firm was accused of filing frivolous claims. But in light of the totality of a well respected career, the Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Ioana Salajanu -- Qualified

Ioana Salajanu was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2000. Since 2015, she has been a partner at Rock, Fusco & Connelly LLP, where she handles matters that include commercial litigation and international mergers and acquisitions. She has also worked as a partner at Bryce, Downey & Lenkov (2012-2015); as a solo practitioner (2005-2015); and as an associate at Childress & Zdeb (2003-2005), Conklin, Murphy, Conklin & Snyder (2002-2003) and Central State Funds (2000-2002).

Ms. Salajanu is considered to have good legal ability. She has conducted few actual trials but has been involved in a substantial motion practice in complex matters. She is reported to have a good temperament. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Russell W. Hartigan

## Hon. Cecilia A. Horan – Qualified

Hon. Cecilia A. Horan was admitted to the Illinois bar in November, 1997. She was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. Before taking the bench, she was a partner at Hinshaw & Culbertson, where she spent most of her career as a lawyer. Her practice concentrated on tort litigation, including personal injury, premises liability, product liability and insurance claims coverage. As a lawyer, Judge Horan was considered to have good legal ability and has experience with more complex litigation matters. She was praised for her temperament both in court and in dealing with opposing counsel. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Keith L. Spence – Not Qualified

Keith L. Spence was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1999. Since 2001, he has been a solo practitioner with a focus on criminal defense, domestic relations, and real estate. Previously, he was an Administrative Hearing Officer for the Village of Dolton, IL (2006-2012) and a trial attorney for the U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (1999-2000).

Mr. Spence has had a long career as a lawyer, but the Council is concerned that he does not have substantial litigation experience in more complex matters. Some respondents also reported that he can have problems with punctuality, and some respondents – particularly women – are concerned about his temperament, including a lack of cooperation and a patronizing attitude. The Council finds him Not Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Michelle D. Jordan

#### Hon. Clare Joyce Quish -- Qualified

Clare Joyce Quish was admitted to practice in 2000. She was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. She was a Partner with Schuyler Roche & Crisham P.C., serving as litigation counsel in a variety of commercial and civil litigation matters in both state and federal courts. She has also had an appellate practice in both state and federal courts, including the Illinois Appellate Court, the Illinois Supreme Court, and the Seventh Circuit Court of Appeals. Before taking the bench, she had been a Partner since 2009 and an Associate between 2007 and 2009. From 2000 to 2007, she was a law clerk to Justice Mary Jane Theis when she was an Appellate Court judge. She has served as an adjunct professor at Loyola University Law School, and serves on the Illinois Supreme Court's Committee for Character and Fitness for the First Judicial District.

Ms. Quish is considered to have good legal ability and has litigation experience in more complex matters. She is well respected as a practitioner, and she is reported to have good temperament. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Jerome C. Barrido -- Qualified

Jerome C. Barrido was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1999. He is a career Assistant Cook County Public Defender. He is currently assigned to a juvenile justice call in a suburban district, where he handles matters ranging from Class X felonies to misdemeanors. He has extensive adult felony and juvenile litigation experience. He is praised as having very good legal ability and temperament. He is considered to be very knowledgeable, and is praised for his trial skills. He is reported to be a zealous advocate while being respectful to judges and opposing counsel. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.,

# **Patrick John – Not Qualified**

Patrick John was admitted to practice in 1998. He is currently an Associate at The Barclay Group where he focuses on family law. From 2001 to 2010 he was an Associate at a small firm and was employed by another private firm between 1998 and 2001. He has served as an associate in two private law firms since being admitted to practice. Mr. John is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. His practice includes a substantial motion practice. The Council, however, is concerned that he does not have sufficient trial experience in complex matters. On balance, the Council finds him Not Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Sheila McGinnis

# **Brian Terrance Sexton – Not Qualified**

Brian Terrance Sexton was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1987. Since 2017, he has worked as a Solo Practitioner at Brian T. Sexton and Associates, PC in Naperville, IL, where he handles criminal defense and some civil plaintiff and defense matters. From 1987 through 2016, worked for the Cook County State's Attorney Office, where he was Chief (2010-2016) and Deputy Chief (2009-2010) of the Narcotics Bureau; Supervisor (2004-2009), Deputy Supervisor (1998-2004), and an Assistant State's Attorney (1994-1998) at the Gang Prosecutions Unit; a Felony Review Trial Supervisor at the Felony Trial Review Unit (1990-1994); and an Assistant State's Attorney in the Night Narcotics, Felony Review, Juvenile, and Appeals Divisions (1987-1990).

Mr. Sexton is considered to have good legal ability and is praised for his legal knowledge and trial skills. Lawyers and judges say he has a good temperament. He has substantial experience in complex criminal law matters, and, most recently, in civil litigation matters. The Council, however, must balance these favorable views with the fact that there have been multiple occasions where the Illinois Appellate Court has reversed convictions because of Mr. Sexton's improper conduct. The grounds for these reversals include a *Batson* violation in one appeal; improperly commenting on a defendant's exercise of the right not to testify in another appeal; and, in a third appeal, using rebuttal argument to accuse a defendant and defense counsel of trying to "fix" the case. Additionally, in cases where the Appellate Court has affirmed conviction, Mr. Sexton's conduct has been criticized, writing in one case that Sexton's remarks in closing argument "troubled" the Court because his closing included comments that "we repeatedly have held cross the line of propriety." On balance, the Council finds Mr. Sexton Not Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## Hon. Peter Michael Gonzalez – Not Qualified

Hon. Peter Michael Gonzalez was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1994. He was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. Before taking the bench, he had been a solo practitioner whose main focus is criminal defense, but who also handles matters that include domestic relations, employment, licensing, and immigration. He has also worked as an administrative law judge in the Illinois Department of Employment Security (2003-2013) and as an Assistant Public Defender in the Cook County Public Defender's Office (1994-2003), where his assignments included Juvenile Delinquency, Juvenile Abuse and Neglect, Preliminary Hearings, Night Narcotics, and the Felony Trial Division. Since 2012, he has been a Member of the Lawyer's Auxiliary Board of the Illinois Judges Foundation. In 2005 and 2007, he was disciplined by his employer, the Illinois Department of Employment Security, for discourtesy during hearings he conducted as an administrative law judge.

In 2013, the Council stated that, "Mr. Gonzalez is reported to have good legal ability and his earlier career involved substantial litigation matters. He was praised for his temperament as defense counsel, and is considered to be a good defense lawyer. The Council, however, is concerned about negative reports concerning his current role as an administrative hearing officer. He is reported to be inappropriately impatient and rude to litigants. He is criticized for the disrespectful manner in which he sometimes treats witnesses. On balance, the Council finds him Not Qualified for the Circuit Court." Since 2013, Mr. Gonzalez had been a solo practitioner and has received positive marks for his work. But the Council continues to be concerned about Mr. Gonzalez's temperament before he took the bench. On balance, the Council finds him Not Qualified.

#### Bradley R. Trowbridge -- Qualified

Bradley R. Trowbridge was admitted to practice in Illinois in 2000. Prior to law school he served as a social worker. Since 2004 he has served as a solo practitioner focusing on domestic relations issues. He has worked as a staff attorney at the Chicago Department of Law; a staff attorney at the Legal Assistance Foundation of Metropolitan Chicago; and as an associate with Audrey Gaynor & Associates. He has done domestic violence order of protection pro bono work.

Mr. Trowbridge is considered to have good legal ability. He has had substantial litigation experience in a variety of areas. Judges and practitioners praise his litigation skills. A few respondents questioned his temperament, but on balance, the Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Jean Prendergast Rooney

### John Joseph Hagerty – Qualified

John Joseph Hagerty was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1990. He is a Partner at Taft Stettinius and Hollister LLP, where he represents public and privately held companies, various local government units and individuals in civil litigation matters. From 1990 to 1994, he served as an Associate at Phelan, Pope, and John Ltd., where he focused on commercial disputes.

Mr. Hagerty is a widely praised attorney with good legal ability. He has substantial litigation experience in complex matters and is reported to have excellent litigation skills. His temperament is unquestioned and many respondents commented on the respect that he shows to opposing counsel. He is active in community activities. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Mable Taylor – Not Recommended

Mable Taylor did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds her Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

# **Subcircuit Elections**

# 1<sup>st</sup> Subciruit

# Vacancy of the Hon. Orville E. Hambright, Jr.

## Hon. Liticia Payne – Qualified

Hon. Liticia Payne was admitted to practice in 1997. She was appointed to the Circuit Court by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2016. Before taking the bench she was an Assistant Will County Public Defender. As a lawyer, she was reported to have good legal ability and had substantial litigation experience. She is reported to have a good temperament. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Erika Lynn Orr – Qualified

Erika Lynn Orr was admitted to practice in 1998. She is a solo practitioner with substantial litigation experience in the family law area. She is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. She is a respected practitioner who is praised for her knowledge of the law in her practice area. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# 2<sup>nd</sup> Subcircuit

# Vacancy of the Hon. Bertina E. Lampkin

# **Tiana Ellis Blakely – Qualified**

Tiana Ellis Blakely was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2004. Since 2005, she has worked as an Assistant Public Defender in the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where she is currently a Grade 3 Attorney. In that capacity, she represents clients in cases ranging from battery to first degree murder. Her pro bono work includes participating in the 34<sup>th</sup> Ward/15<sup>th</sup> Legislative District Expungement Fair and serving in the Polished Pebbles program, where she speaks to participants about understanding their legal rights.

Ms. Blakely is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. She has substantial litigation experience and is praised for her trial skills. She assists with the defense in murder trials although she is not the lead attorney. Ms. Blakely has only 13 years of experience as an attorney but she has had a variety of legal experiences and is considered a solid defense attorney. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Hon. Frederick Bates – Qualified

Hon. Frederick Bates was admitted to practice in 1983. Judge Bates was appointed to the Circuit Court by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2015. He was a sole practitioner between 2000 and

2013 and served as an Administrative Law Judge between 2000 and 2015. He was also a Partner at Wildman, Harrold between 1997 and 1999, President of Albert, Bates Whitehead & McGaugh between 1992 and 1997, was a partner with Bell, Boyd and Lloyd between 1988 and 1992. He is considered to have good legal ability and is praised for his temperament. He has substantial litigation experience in a variety of matters. He is praised for both his litigation skills and for his skills as an Administrative Law Judge. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Marjorie C. Laws

# William Hanson Laws - Qualified

William Hanson Laws was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1980. Since that time, he has been a Solo Practitioner at William H. Laws, Ltd., where he focuses on criminal defense. He has represented clients in State and Federal courts, in cases ranging from misdemeanors to first degree murder and drug conspiracy cases. He is a member of the Cook County Bar Association and has provided pro bono services through its volunteer legal clinic.

Mr. Laws is considered to have good legal ability and has substantial litigation experience in criminal law and civil rights matters. He is reported to have a good temperament and most respondents praise his litigation skills. Mr. Laws had one serious issue with a federal jury case that involved a conspiracy with nine co-defendants. The Federal Defender who ultimately represented Mr. Laws' client claimed on a Habeas petition that the client had received ineffective defense counsel at trial. The judge concluded that Mr. Laws' representation was lacking. The Council must balance this case against a long career of being considered a solid practitioner. The Council finds Mr. Laws Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## Hon. Adrienne E. Davis -- Qualified

Hon. Adrienne E. Davis was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1994. In March 2017, she was appointed a Cook County Circuit Court judge by the Illinois Supreme Court. Since that time, she has presided in the First Municipal District. Previously she had been an Assistant Public Defender at the Cook County Public Defender's Office (1995-2017), where, from 2010 to 2017, she was assigned to the Homicide Task Force. She was the Law Day 2017 Chair of the Cook County Bar Association and the National Legal Counsel to Top Ladies of Distinction from 2016 to 2017.

Judge Davis was well respected as an Assistant Cook County Public Defender with substantial litigation experience in complex matters. She has received positive reviews in her tenure as a Circuit Judge. She is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. James L. Rhodes

## Hon. Toya T. Harvey -- Qualified

Hon. Toya T. Harvey was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1995. She was appointed to the bench as a Circuit Judge by the Illinois Supreme Court in March 2017. From 1996 to 2017, she worked for the Office of the Cook County Public Defender, where since 2013 she was a Grade IV Assistant Public Defender on the Suburban Homicide Task Force. She has provided pro bono services at various expungement summits, including the 2017 County-wide Expungement Summit sponsored by the Clerk of the Court.

As a lawyer, Judge Harvey was considered to be a zealous advocate for her clients and possessed a good temperament. She was a career assistant public defender and had substantial experience with complex criminal law matters. She is reported to have good legal ability. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Tiesha L. Smith – Not Recommended

Tiesha L. Smith did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds her Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. John D. Turner, Jr.

## Hon. Travis Richardson - Well Qualified

Hon. Travis Richardson was admitted to practice in 1997. He was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2017. He had been in private practice for most of his career, focusing on litigation matters in both state and federal courts. His litigation experience spans both civil matters and criminal defense work. He is active in community efforts, and served as a Hearing Examiner for the Chicago Board of Elections between 2010 and 2012. Mr. Richardson is considered to have excellent legal ability. He had substantial litigation experience in more complex matters and is widely praised for his professionalism, his knowledge of the law, and for his temperament. He was reported to be exceptionally hard-working and a zealous advocate for his clients. He is also reported to have demonstrated his interest in improving the legal system. The Chicago Council of Lawyers finds Mr. Richardson to be Well Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Ieshia Eshale Gray – Qualified

Ieshia Eschale Gray was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2002. Since 2004, she has worked as an Assistant Public Defender in the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where she is currently a Grade III Felony Attorney. She has also worked as a Coordinator in the Cook County Court, Civil Protection Division (2003-2004). She has provided pro bono services in wills, trusts, and real estate matters at the Chesterfield Community Council Legal Clinic.

Ms. Gray is considered to have good temperament and has substantial litigation experience. She is active in community activities. Many respondents reported that she is a solid criminal defense counsel and praised her for being able to provide good legal representation in the midst of busy, competing cases in different courtrooms. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Camille E. Willis

#### Hon. Debra A. Seaton -- Qualified

Hon. Debra A. Seaton was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1986. She was appointed to the bench as a Circuit Judge by the Illinois Supreme Court in May 2017. Between 2010 and the time of her appointment to the bench, she served as a supervisor at the Legal Resources Division of the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where she also worked from 1988 to 2000. She has also worked as a solo practitioner, focusing on defending death penalty cases (2000-2010); as an Assistant Public Defender in the Kane County Public Defender's Office in Geneva, IL (1987-1988); and as an Assistant Appellate Public Defender at the Office of the State Appellate

Defender, in Mt. Vernon, IL (1986-1987). She has provided pro bono services at the Mandel Legal Aid Clinic at the University of Chicago Law School, and is a participant in the ABA Mock Trials.

Judge. Seaton is considered to have good legal ability. She is reported to be very knowledgeable, and is a zealous but highly ethical practitioner. She has substantial litigation experience in complex matters, and is praised for her trial skills. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## Sheree D. Henry -- Qualified

Sheree D. Henry was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1994, Since 1999, she has been an Assistant Public Defender in Cook County Public Defender's Office, where she represents indigent clients in felony cases. She has also worked as an Assistant Public Guardian in the Cook County Public Guardian's Office (1995-1999), where she represented abused and neglected children in Juvenile Court.

Ms. Henry is considered to have good legal ability with substantial bench and jury litigation experience in a variety of criminal law matters. Respondents say generally that she is a good lawyer with good trial skills. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Ubi O'Neal – Not Recommended

Ubi O'Neal did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds him Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Valerie Turner

#### **Devlin Schoop – Well Qualified**

Devlin Schoop was admitted to practice in 1997. He is a Partner with Laner Muchin. From 1997 to 1999 he clerked for Judge Blanche Manning. From 1999 to 2003 he was an Associate with Wildman Harrold Allen & Dixon. He then became an Associate with Laner Muchin. Mr. Schoop has authored IILCE continuing legal education materials on age and employment discrimination issues. He is exceptionally active in pro bono and civic matters and received the U.S. District Court's Award for Excellence in Pro Bono Service. He is a Panel Chair for the Hearing Board of the ARDC. Mr. Schoop has extensive litigation experience in complex matters in both state and federal courts. His practice has included a variety of civil law areas including labor relations, Chancery work, and commercial litigation. He is considered to have very good legal ability and trial skills. His temperament is reported to be excellent and his integrity is unquestioned. The Council finds him Well Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Arthur W. Willis -- Qualified

Arthur W. Willis was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1994. He is an Assistant Public Defender in the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where he represents indigent clients in felony matters.

Mr. Willis is considered to have good legal ability. He is praised by prosecutors, other defense counsel, and judges for the quality of his motion practice, research, and grasp of legal issues. He has a professional demeanor. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# 3<sup>rd</sup> Subcircuit

# Vacancy of the Hon. Maureen F. Delehanty

#### Hon. Patrick Thomas Stanton – Qualified

Hon. Patrick Thomas Stanton was admitted to practice in 1993. He was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2017. Before taking the bench, Judge Stanton was a Member with Dykema Gossett. He has been in private practice throughout his career.

Judge Stanton is considered to have good legal ability and is praised for his litigation skills in both state and federal courts. He is considered to be exceptionally knowledgeable about the law, and is reported to have good temperament. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

### **Michael Hayes – Not Qualified**

Michael Hayes was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2002. Since 2008, he has worked as a Law Instructor with the Chicago Police Department; he is also a Solo Practitioner at the Hayes Advocacy Group (2006-present). Previously, he has worked as an Assistant State's Attorney at the Cook County State's Attorney Office (2003-2006), as a Legal Officer at the Chicago Police Department (2002-2003), and as a Police Officer with the Chicago Police Department.

Mr. Hayes is considered to be knowledgeable about Fourth Amendment issues. His temperament is unquestioned. Much of his litigation experience is not recent and most of that experience is in less complex matters. He has demonstrated that he has good legal ability but the Council is concerned about the depth and breadth of his experience. The Council finds him Not Qualified at this time.

#### Kevin Patrick Cunningham – Qualified

Kevin Patrick Cunningham was admitted in 1992. He is a sole practitioner and a prosecutor for the Village of Oak Lawn. From 1992-1998 he served as an Assistant State's Attorney and from 1998 to 2001 did criminal defense and personal injury litigation for a private firm. As lead trial counsel he reports taking 31 criminal and 2 civil cases to a jury verdict and around 100 to a bench verdict. He has litigated three appellate cases. Mr. Cunningham is reported to have good legal ability and temperament. He is considered to be a skilled practitioner who is hard-working and conscientious. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# 4<sup>th</sup> Subcircuit

# Vacancy of the Hon. Thomas M. Davy

## Hon. David R. Navarro – Well Qualified

Hon. David R. Navarro was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1993. In May 2017 he appointed by the Illinois Supreme Court to the Circuit Court of Cook County. He is currently assigned to Central Bond Court. He served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney from 1993 to 2009. In 2009, he joined the Illinois Attorney General's Office, where he was chief of the Public Integrity Bureau. In 2007 he was appointed a special Assistant U.S. Attorney to work on an investigation involving the Chicago Police Department's Special Operations Section. He is widely praised for his knowledge, his trial skills, and his integrity. He is often described as being

fair and honest. He is considered to have excellent legal ability and is praised for his supervisory skills, as well. The Council finds him Well Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# **Caroline Jamieson Golden – Qualified**

Caroline Jamieson Golden was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1992. Since 2010, she has been an Associate at Sotos Law, PC, where her practice consists of civil rights defense and appellate work. Previously, she was an Associate and then a Litigation Partner at Neal, Gerber, and Eisenberg, where she handled commercial litigation defense (1996-2002), and an Associate at Querrey and Harrow, where she focused on insurance defense work (1992-1996).

Ms. Golden is considered to have good legal ability. She has substantial experience in complex litigation matters, and is praised widely for her litigation skills. She is praised for her professional demeanor and is reported to be especially hard working and diligent. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. James G. Riley

### Hon. John O'Meara - Qualified

Hon. John O'Meara was admitted to practice in 1995. He was appointed to the bench in 2016 by the Illinois Supreme Court. He currently presides over cases in the First Municipal District where he is well-respected. Before taking the bench, he was a trial attorney at the Curcio Law Offices. As a lawyer, Judge O'Meara was considered to have good legal ability and he had substantial litigation experience in more complex matters. He is reported to have had good temperament both as a lawyer and as a judge. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Elizabeth Ciaccia-Lezza – Qualified

Elizabeth Ciaccia-Lezza was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2001. She is an Assistant State's Attorney at the Cook County State's Attorney Office, where since 2012 she has served as a prosecutor in the Sex Crimes Unit. Previously she served in the Felony Domestic Violence Unit (2009-2012), the Felony Trial Courtroom (2009), the Preliminary Hearings Unit (2008-2009), the Felony Review Unit (2006-2008), the Juvenile Justice Bureau-Delinquency Division (2003-2006), the Juvenile Justice Bureau-Child Protection Division (2002-2003) and the Child Support Enforcement Divisions (2001-2002).

Ms. Ciaccia-Lezza is considered to have good legal ability and is praised for having a strong grasp of the evidentiary and procedural rules. She has substantial litigation experience and is reported to have excellent knowledge of her area of law. She is considered to have a good temperament with good working relationships with victims, witnesses, court personnel, and opposing counsel. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## **Daniel L. Collins – Qualified**

Daniel L. Collins was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1998. Since 2014, he has been President and Solo Proprietor of the Dan Collins Law Firm, where he handles worker compensation, business, and employment litigation. He also handled worker compensation litigation at Krol, Bongiorno, and Given, where he was an Associate from 2003 to 2014. From 1999 to 2003, he was an Assistant State's Attorney at the Cook County State's Attorney Office, where he tried preliminary hearing and misdemeanor cases and conducted felony review. Mr. Collins is widely praised as having very good legal ability and excellent research and writing skills. He has substantial litigation experience and is reported to have very good litigation skills. He has a professional demeanor, and, in general, is a well respected practitioner with a variety of experiences. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Martin D. Reggi -- Qualified

Martin D. Reggi was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1980. Since 1985, he has been a solo practitioner who focuses on areas of law that include criminal, civil, real estate, bankruptcy, and traffic matters, as well as Secretary of State Hearings.

Mr. Reggi is considered to be a good practitioner with a good temperament. Much of his practice has involved less complex matters, but he does have litigation experience involving a variety of complex legal matters. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# 5<sup>th</sup> Subcircuit

# Vacancy of the Hon. Patricia Banks

# **Rhonda Sallee – Not Recommended**

Rhonda Sallee did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds her Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

# Hon. H. Yvonne Coleman – Qualified

Hon. H. Yvonne Coleman was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1988. Since 2017, she has served as a Judge in the Circuit Court of Cook County, where she is currently assigned to the Municipal Department, District 1, Non-Jury Civil Section. Previously, she was a Solo Practitioner with a focus on civil rights and employment law (2010-2017); General Counsel to the Independent Police Review Board of the City of Chicago (2009-2010); Attorney at the Law Office of H. Yvonne Coleman (2004-2009; 1992-1999); Manager and Chief Administrative Law Judge of the Illinois Department of Employment Security, Appeals Division (2003-2004); Chief of the Civil Rights Bureau of the Attorney General of the State of Illinois (1999-2003); Executive Director of the Cook County Bar Association Community Law Project (1989-1994); and Staff Attorney at the National Labor Relations Board, Region 13, Chicago, Illinois (1988-1989). She has served as Executive Director of the Cook County Bar Association and is a member of the Chicago Bar Association, where she was Chair of the Civil Rights Committee and a member of the Judicial Evaluation Committee.

As a lawyer the Council stated:

"Ms. Coleman is considered to have good legal ability with a wide range of legal experience, including litigation in more complex matters. She is praised for her temperament and for her trial skills. She is reported to be a good lawyer who is exceptionally active in community affairs. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court."

As a judge for a short period of time, Judge Coleman has received high marks for her ability to manage a courtroom. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Gino Betts – Not Recommended**

Gino Betts did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds him Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

#### **Gwendolyn D. Anderson – Not Recommended**

Gwendolyn D. Anderson did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds her Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Rickey Jones

# Hon. Marian Emily Perkins - Qualified

Marian Emily Perkins was admitted to practice in 1987. She was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. Before taking the bench, she was a sole practitioner doing criminal law and domestic violence cases. She reports having been a trial advisor at the University of Chicago Mandel Clinic Intensive Trial Techniques Course. She was also a Commissioner on the Illinois Supreme Court Committee on Character and Fitness and a Commissioner on the 2009 State of Illinois Disproportionate Justice Impact Study Commission. Judge Perkins, as a lawyer, had been lead counsel in more complex jury and bench trials, including a recent three day trial, and bench trials in juvenile and felony trial courtrooms. She had substantial recent experience in more complex litigation matters. Judge Perkins is reported to have good legal ability and temperament. She was praised for her trial skills as well as for her civic activities. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Jenetia Marshall – Not Recommended

Jenetia Marshall did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds her Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

#### **David Lewis Kelly – Qualified**

David Lewis Kelly was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2001. Since 2006, he has been a Solo Practitioner primarily focused on criminal defense, civil litigation, and real estate. Previously he was Of Counsel at the Property Law Group, LLC (2013-2015), where represented landlords and condominium associations, and investors and individuals in real estate transactions; and served as an Assistant State's Attorney at the Cook County State's Attorney Office (2001-2006). He is a member of the Cook County Bar Association, where he has served as Executive Board Member/Secretary (2013-2015) and provided pro bono services in Expungement Workshops and the Legal Assistance Program for low-income individuals.

Mr. Kelly is considered to have good legal ability. He is reported to be very knowledgeable with a good temperament. He has substantial litigation experience in more complex matters. He is praised for his litigation skills and for his integrity. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Edward Washington, II

#### Hon. Robert F. Harris – Qualified

Hon. Robert F. Harris was admitted to practice in 1991. He was appointed to the Circuit Court by the Illinois Supreme Court. Before taking the bench, he served as the Cook County

Public Guardian. Mr Harris is considered to have good legal ability and was reported to be a good administrator. He has substantial litigation experience. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## Shay T. Allen – Not Qualified

Shay T. Allen was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2005. He is a solo practitioner who focuses on criminal defense but also handles civil litigation and civil rights litigation. Between 2011 and 2013 he was an associate at Lee and Fairman LLP, where he practiced criminal defense law. As an Assistant State's Attorney at the Cook County State's Attorney Office (2006-2011), he worked in the Criminal Appeals Division as well as the Maywood Courthouse, where he served in the domestic violence call, as well as the preliminary hearings and misdemeanor courtrooms.

Mr. Allen is considered to have good legal ability, and both lawyers and judges describe him as being a good trial lawyer. He is reported to have a good temperament. The Council is concerned about his relative short career and the short period of time in which he has been involved in more complex matters. The Council finds him Not Qualified for the Circuit Court at this time.

## Mary Alice Melchor – Not Qualified

Mary Alice Melchor was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1992. She is Inspector General for the Office of the Clerk of the Cook County Circuit Court, where she previously served as Officer (2003-2005) and as Chief Deputy Clerk of Maybrook Courthouse (2002-2003). She has also worked as a Solo Practitioner at the Law Offices of Mary Melchor (2000-2002), where she specialized in family law and real estate law; an Associate in two insurance defense firms, Meachum, Spahr, Cozzi, and Postel (1998-2000) and Hammond & Flynn Law Firm (1992-1993); and a Senior Attorney in the Torts Department of the Chicago Housing Authority (1994-1998). She is a member of a number of bar associations, where she has held offices that include President of the Black Women Lawyer's Association (2008-2009); Chair of the Local Government Committee of the Chicago Bar Association (2016-2018); Treasurer of the National Bar Association, Region VII (2009-2018); and Member of the Board of Directors of the Women's Bar Association of Illinois (2016-2018).

In 2009, the Council stated in an evaluation, "Ms. Melchor is highly praised for her temperament and for her community service. The Council is concerned, however, because she has not had substantial experience with complex litigation matters. The Council finds her Not Qualified for the Circuit Court." The current evaluation shows that Ms. Melchor is a smart and respected attorney who works exceptionally hard and is knowledgeable about the areas in which she practices. But she does not have substantial experience in complex litigation matters – an important requirement for any judicial candidate. The Council finds her Not Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Sixth Subcircuit

# Vacancy of the Hon. Gloria Chevere

# **David C. Herrera – Not Qualified**

David C. Herrera was admitted to practice in 2000. He is a career Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. He is actively involved in community activities. He is considered to have good legal ability. He is praised for being hard-working and he is reported to have substantial litigation experience in more complex matters. However, memos which were the subject of a recent media article raises concerns about his temperament and respect for women. Further investigation has added to the Council's concerns about these issues. On balance, the Council finds him Not Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## Hon. Kent Delgado - Well Qualified

Hon. Kent Delgado was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1996. Since 2016, he has been an appointed Judge in the Circuit Court of Cook County, Probate Division, where he oversees the creation and management of minor estate guardianships. He was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. As a Judge, he has also presided over traffic cases in Municipal Court. Previously, he was a Solo Practitioner at the Law Office of Kent Delgado (2016); Partner at Delgado and Tiernan, P.C. (2007-2015); and an Assistant State's Attorney in the Cook County State's Attorney Office (1996-2007), where he was assigned to the Appellate, Municipal, and Felony Trial divisions.

As an attorney, the Council found that Mr. Delgado had substantial trial experience in more complex matters. He was respected for his knowledge of the law and for his litigation skills. He was considered to have good legal ability and temperament, and was praised for his willingness to mentor other attorneys. Judge Delgado is considered to be a knowledgeable and capable judge. He is praised for his dealings with pro se litigants. He is widely praised for his ability to manage his probate courtroom and for the sensitivity that he shows to litigants. The Council finds him Well Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Sean Patrick Kelly – Not Qualified

Sean Patrick Kelly was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2006. Since 2007, he has worked as an Assistant State's Attorney in the DuPage County State's Attorney Office, where he focuses on criminal prosecution and civil practice. From 2006 to 2007, he was an Associate and General Counsel to the Haymarket Group, where his duties included general legal consulting and lobbying.

Sean Patrick Kelly is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. The Council is concerned, however, that Mr. Kelly has had substantial litigation experience in mostly non-complex matters and he has relatively few years of practice. The Council finds him Not Qualified for the Circuit Court at this time.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Richard C. Cooke

#### Edward J. Underhill -- Qualified

Edward J. Underhill was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1984. He briefly worked for the State's Attorney's Office and Paul W. Grauer & Associates, but was then hired by his current firm, Madusa, Funai, Eifert & Mitchell, in 1985. Mr. Underhill focuses on business litigation and counseling and has been a partner since 1997.

Mr. Underhill is considered to be a solid practitioner with good legal ability and substantial litigation experience in a variety of commercial litigation matters. He has published

articles on legal topics, and is praised for his research and writing skills. He has a professional demeanor. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Hon. Charles S. Beach -- Qualified

Hon. Charles S. Beach was admitted to practice in 1996. He was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. Before taking the bench, he was a sole practitioner doing primarily criminal defense work in felony and misdemeanor cases. The bulk of his practice was DUI defense. In addition to the criminal defense aspect of his practice, he did the civil law portion of DUI defense known as the Statutory Summary Suspension actions where the rules of civil procedure apply except for the right to depose a witness. In addition to being a sole practitioner he was an associate in a small private practice firm doing criminal defense, was a Law Clerk to Illinois Appellate Justice Judith Koehler, and served for one year as an Assistant Cook County Public Defender. He is the author of an IICLE chapter, "The Chicago Traffic Court: Procedures and Practices," published in 2011. Mr. Beach was considered to very knowledgeable in the areas of law he practiced. He is considered by many to be an expert in DUI law and had experience in more complex litigation. The Council is concerned about the narrowness of his practice before taking the bench, but notes that he had broader experience as a criminal defense practitioner, and had substantial litigation experience. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Andrea M. Webber -- Qualified

Andrea M. Webber was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2002. She is an Assistant Public Defender at the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where she currently serves in the Homicide Task Force Division. Previously, she served in the Felony Trial (2004-2014) and Traffic (2003-2004) Divisions. She has also worked for Kumlin and Fromm (2002-2003), where she handled personal injury and workers' compensation cases. She volunteers for Lawyers in the Classrooms, and in 2008 served as a judicial evaluations investigator for the Puerto Rican Bar Association.

Ms. Webber is considered to have good legal ability. She has substantial experience in complex matters and is praised as a solid practitioner with good trial skills. She is reported to have a good temperament and is considered exceptionally hard working. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Robert Lopez Cepero

## Linda Perez – Qualified

Linda Perez was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2001.Since 2002, she has worked at the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where her current title is Assistant Public Defender III. She has held positions in the Felony Trial Division (2013-2018), the Juvenile Justice Division (2012-2013, 2004), the Misdemeanor Division (2005-2012), and the Civil Child Protection Division (2002-2004).

Ms. Perez is considered to have good legal ability and has a professional demeanor. She has had a variety of experiences as an Assistant Public Defender and has defended more complex matters as part of her assignment to the Felony Trial Division for the past five years. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Hon. Stephanie K. Miller -- Qualified

Hon. Stephanie K. Miller was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1999. In January 2017 the Illinois Supreme Court appointed her a Circuit Court Judge to fill the Lopez-Cepero vacancy in the 6<sup>th</sup> Judicial Subcircuit. She currently presides in Central Bond Court, and served previous assignments in traffic court, as well as misdemeanor and felony preliminary hearings courtrooms. From 2001 to 2017, she was an Assistant State's Attorney in the Cook County State's Attorney Office, where she worked in Juvenile Court, Preliminary Hearings, Felony Review, the Felony Trial Division, and the Sex Crimes Division. From 1999 to 2001 she was an Assistant Public Guardian in the Cook County Public Guardian's Office.

As a lawyer, Judge Miller was considered to have good legal ability and temperament. She had a well-respected career as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney's Office with substantial litigation experience in complex matters. She has earned praise for her work as a judge. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# 8<sup>th</sup> Subcircuit

# Vacancy of the Hon. Candace J. Fabri

### James A. Shapiro -- Qualified

James A. Shapiro was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1985. He is a solo practitioner who focuses on federal and state criminal defense matters, and occasionally on civil litigation. He has worked on similar matters as an associate or partner for a number of private law firms (1996-2007; 1985-1989). He has also been a Circuit Court Judge assigned to the Maywood court (2007-2012), and an Assistant U.S. Attorney at the U.S. Attorney's Office (1989-1995). He is a past president of the Decalogue Society of Lawyers (2007-2008), and has chaired several committees for the Chicago Bar Association. He has provided pro bono services for a number of organizations, including Amicus Poloniae (a CVLS-affiliated group, 2013-present) and the Center for Disability and Elder Law (1996-2006).

Judge Shapiro has been found Qualified for the Circuit Court by the Council in past evaluations. As a practitioner, he has had substantial litigation experience in both civil and criminal law matters, and in both trial and appellate court matters. He received praise from practitioners for his legal ability and for his diligence both as a practitioner and as a judge. He is also reported to have a professional demeanor in both capacities. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## Stephen J. Feldman – Not Qualified

Stephen J. Feldman was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2001. Since 2003, he has been a solo practitioner focusing in criminal defense and DUI defense. From 2011 to the present, he has been working as an adjunct professor at the John Marshall Law School, where he teaches trial advocacy. Previously (2005-2015), he was engaged part-time as a hearing officer in the Administrative Hearings Department of the Illinois Secretary of State.

In an earlier evaluation, the Council said that "Mr. Feldman is considered to have good legal ability and knowledgeable about his areas of practice. He is reported to have a good temperament, with high integrity. He has substantial litigation experience, including trial work. These cases, however, are often in less complex matters. This is a close call in light of his substantial experience, but at this point in his career, Mr. Feldman does not have substantial experience in sophisticated matters. The Council finds him Not Qualified for the Circuit Court."

Since that evaluation, although Mr. Feldman has added some complex criminal defense work to his career, we continue to, on balance, find him Not Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Hon. Robin Denise Shoffner - Qualified

Hon. Robin Denise Shoffner was admitted to practice in 1990 and was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2014 and served until 2016. She has been re-appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. She had been an Assistant Corporation Counsel for the City of Chicago Department of Law where she represented the City of Chicago and police officers in civil litigation defense. She served as lead trial counsel. After clerking for the Hon. Glenn T. Johnson, she was an Associate with Carney and Brothers from 1992 to 1995. She then worked as an Assistant Corporation Counsel from 1995 to 1998 and then was a senior litigation associate for a small litigation firm from 1998 to 2000. From 2000 to 2007 she was litigation counsel for the AON Corporation. Ms. Shoffner has substantial litigation experience in both state and federal courts. Her experience is varied including civil rights defense, commercial litigation, and torts. She is reported to have good legal ability. She was considered to be very knowledgeable and capable as an attorney. She is reported to have a low-key, professional demeanor. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### John Christopher Benson -- Qualified

John Christopher Benson was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1989. He is a solo practitioner focusing on criminal law and civil rights. Previously, he was Director of Criminal Law at Cabrini Green Legal Aid, where he worked from 2003 to 2010. Between 1989 and 2003, he worked as a trial attorney in the Cook County Public Defender's Office. He has been active in NAACP's Kankakee branch in multiple roles, including as a volunteer in its legal aid clinic. He also participated in the 24<sup>th</sup> District Legal Expungement Summit (2016), where he advised residents about their rights to have their criminal records sealed or expunged.

Mr. Benson is considered to have good legal ability and has substantial litigation experience in a variety of matters. He is reported to have good temperament. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Bonnie C. McGrath – Not Recommended**

Bonnie C. McGrath did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds her Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Laura C. Liu

## Lindsay Christopher Huge` -- Qualified

Lindsay Christopher Huge´ was admitted to practice in 1989. He is a career public defender with the Cook County Public Defender's Office. He currently serves in the Appeals, Post-Convictions, and Legal Resources section, but has served as a trial attorney, defending complex criminal actions.

Mr. Huge´ is considered to have good legal ability and is praised for his knowledge of the law. He is reported to be both a good trial and appellate attorney. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Hon. Michael A. Forti -- Qualified

Hon. Michael A. Forti was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1980. In 2016, he was appointed a Circuit Judge by the Illinois Supreme Court, and is currently assigned to the Domestic Relations Division of the Circuit Court of Cook County. Previously he was chief counsel and ethics officer at the Illinois Department of Transportation (2012-2015); deputy corporation counsel (1999-2012) and chief assistant corporation counsel (1994-1998) for the City of Chicago Department of Law; and associate (1980-1988) and equity and income partner (1988-1994) at Bell Boyd & Lloyd (now K&L Gates), where he handled commercial litigation and antitrust counseling.

Judge Forti was considered to be a good attorney with good legal ability and temperament. As a judge, he continues to receive very positive marks. He has demonstrated his ability to handle a high volume call and is praised for his handling of pro se litigants – respectful and informative without going beyond the role of judge. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Cyrus Hosseini – Not Recommended

Cyrus Hosseini did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds him Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

#### Athena Aphrodite Farmakis -- Qualified

Athena Aphrodite Farmakis was admitted to practice in Illinois in 1993. Since 2014, she has been the Supervisor of the Preliminary Hearings Branch at the Cook County State's Attorney's Office, where she supervises all felony cases brought before the court for a preliminary hearing. Ms. Farmakis has worked for the State's Attorney's Office since 1994. The majority of her experience is in the Felony Trial Division, but she also has experience in the Child Protection Division and the Juvenile Justice Division. Ms. Farmakis was formerly the Judicial Evaluation Chair and is currently the Director of the Lawyer of the Year Committee for the Hellenic Bar Association.

Ms. Farmakis is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. She is reported to be a good prosecutor who is professional and fair in her legal dealings. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Sheryl A. Pethers

# Hon. Jeanne Marie Wrenn -- Qualified

Hon. Jeanne Marie Wrenn was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2003. She was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. Before taking the bench, she served as an Ethics Officer and EEO Officer for Pace. She had been there since 2012. Before that she worked as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney where she prosecuted felon narcotics cases, and was then assigned to be the Legislative Liaison to the Illinois General Assembly.

Ms. Wrenn has bench and jury trial experience in less complex matters, but her work in the legislative arena and her work as an Ethics Officer required detailed analysis and advocacy involving complex matters. She was praised for her work both as a prosecutor and a legislative analyst. She is reported to have very good legal ability and temperament. The Council balances relatively limited litigation experience before taking the bench against other experiences that demonstrate strong analytic thinking. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Hon. Myron Mackoff – Qualified

Hon. Myron Mackoff was admitted to practice in 1994. He was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. He had served as an Assistant Illinois Attorney General from 1994 to 2002, after which he entered private practice. He practiced in both state and federal courts and has experience litigating complex matters. He is involved in numerous pro bono and community activities, including an award for excellence in pro bono work from the Federal Trial Bar. Judge Mackoff is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Rishi Agrawal -- Qualified**

Rishi Agrawal was admitted to practice in 1998. He is a sole practitioner, specializing in litigation in commercial, criminal, and family law. He has practiced in small firms, including Eimer Stahl, throughout his career. He has substantial experience in more complex litigation matters. He is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. He is considered to be a solid, hard-working practitioner with substantial litigation experience. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# **10<sup>th</sup> Subcircuit**

# Vacancy of the Hon. Eileen O'Neill Burke

# Hon. Stephanie D. Saltouros -- Qualified

Hon. Stephanie D. Saltouros was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1996. In September 2016 the Illinois Supreme Court appointed her as a Circuit Judge. She is currently a assigned to the First Municipal District in Cook County Circuit Court. Previously, she was a solo practitioner with a practice focused on criminal defense (2008-2016), and an Assistant Attorney in the Cook County State's Attorney Office (1996-2008), where she prosecuted criminal and traffic cases. She is a member of the Pensions and Benefits Committee of the Illinois Judges Association.

Judge Saltouros is considered to have good legal ability. Respondents praised her as a prosecutor, a criminal defense practitioner, and as a judge. She is reported to have a professional demeanor. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Gwyn E. Ward-Brown – Qualified

Gwyn E. Ward-Brown was admitted to the Wisconsin Bar in 1989 and to the Illinois Bar in 1991. She is an Assistant Public Defender in the Cook County Public Defender's Office.

Ms. Brown is considered to have good legal ability who is knowledgeable about her area of law. She is reported to be a mentor in her office of other lawyers. She has substantial litigation experience, although she has been handling post conviction and appellate matters for the past five years. She is praised for her temperament. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Lorraine Lynnot Murphy – Qualified

Lorraine Lynnot Murphy was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2003. She is an Assistant State's Attorney at the Cook County State's Attorney Office, where she currently is First Chair in a felony courtroom at the George Leighton Criminal Courthouse. She is a member of several

bar associations, including the Chicago Bar Association, where she served on the Judicial Evaluation Committee.

Ms. Murphy is considered to have good legal ability. She is reported to have a good temperament and is praised for her trial skills. She has substantial experience in complex litigation matters and is currently a lead prosecutor in a felony trial courtroom. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Donald J. Suriano

#### **Colleen Daly -- Qualified**

Colleen Daly Colleen Daly was admitted to practice in 1996. She is currently a sole practitioner and reports that she concentrates in criminal defense, juvenile law (both child protection matters and delinquency cases), traffic, appellate work, and some domestic relations. She represents police officers in administrative proceedings. She has been a sole practitioner since January 2010, although she had a partner for part of the time. From 1996 through 2009 she served as an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. Her assignments included the juvenile division, and the felony trial division. She served as a first chair prosecutor. She has substantial litigation experience in more complex jury and bench trials. In the last three years, Ms. Daly reports that she has represented police officers in administrative, evidentiary hearings. She has also been appointed to be a Guardian Ad Litem in cases involving minors. Ms. Daly also reported a federal court litigation practice, including litigation claiming racial discrimination and cases involving criminal extortion. Ms. Daly is reported generally to have good legal ability and knowledge of the law. She is praised for her trial skills, and for being knowledgeable and always well-prepared. She is described by opposing counsel as professional and diligent in following through on such items as discovery requests. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Noreen Patricia Connolly – Not Recommended

Noreen Patricia Connolly did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds her Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

# Hon. Gerald Patrick Cleary III – Qualified

Hon. Gerald Patrick Cleary III has been a lawyer since 1989. He was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court. Before taking the bench he was a partner at SmithAmundsun, doing a variety of civil litigation. He led the firm's aerospace practice and also represents municipalities and corporations in civil rights matters. From 1990 to 1997 he was an associate attorney at Query & Harrow doing civil litigation. Judge Cleary is considered to have good legal ability and an excellent temperament. He was praised for being exceptionally knowledgeable, hard-working, and fair. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Jill Rose Quinn – Not Qualified

Jill Rose Quinn was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1983. Ms. Quinn began her career at Michael Barford as an associate. She then spent three years at Mevorah and Associates. In 1988, she worked at Jegen and Associates doing municipal law. She worked there until she started a solo practice in 1996, focusing on real estate. Additionally, she has worked as a Cook County arbitrator and a DuPage County arbitrator.

Ms. Quinn is considered to have good legal ability and temperament, but she lacks substantial litigation experience in more complex legal areas. The Council finds her Not Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Thomas J. Gabryszewski – Qualified

Thomas J. Gabryszewski was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1990. Since 1997, he has been the Owner and Sole Practitioner at Thomas J. Gabryszewski, Attorney at Law, where he focuses on personal injury and tort cases. He has also handled personal injury matters as a Litigation Associate at Chase and Werner (1991-1997) and as an Associate at Sandman, Levy, and Petrich (1990-1991). He provides pro bono legal services for the Amicus Polonie Pro Bono Legal Clinic of Chicago Volunteer Legal Services.

Mr. Gabryszewski is considered to have good legal ability. He has a broad range of legal experience and is praised for his knowledge of the law. He is reported to have good temperament and does substantial pro bono representation work. He has solid litigation experience. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# 11<sup>th</sup> Subcircuit

# Vacancy of the Hon. Kathleen G. Kennedy

# Hon. Joanne F. Rosado -- Qualified

Hon. Joanne F. Rosado was admitted to practice in 2001. She was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2017. Before taking the bench, she was a career Assistant Cook County Public Defender. She served as a First Chair Public Defender in murder cases, assigned to the Multiple Defendants Unit. She had substantial litigation experience in more complex matters in both civil and criminal law cases, having been assigned to the section doing child protection cases. Ms. Rosado is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. She was praised for her litigation skills and for having been a strong advocate while maintaining a professional demeanor. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Scott Jay Frankel – Well Qualified

Scott Jay Frankel was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1987. He is a Partner at Frankel and Cohen, where he represents clients in criminal and some civil cases. Previously he served in the Cook County Public Defender's Office, where he represented clients in misdemeanor and felony courtrooms (1989-1992); as an Associate at Mayer Brown (1987-1989); and as a Clerk in the U.S. District Court, Southern District of Cincinnati, Ohio (1985-1987).

Mr. Frankel is considered to have very good legal ability. He practices primarily in criminal matters in federal court, where is praised for his litigation skills. He has substantial experience in complex litigation and has experience in both criminal and civil matters. He is reported to be respectful to opposing counsel and is generally praised for his temperament. He is reported to be exceptionally conscientious. The Council finds him Well Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# 12<sup>th</sup> Subcircuit

# Vacancy of the Hon. William O. Maki

#### **David Lawrence Studenroth -- Qualified**

David Lawrence Studenroth was admitted to the Illinois bar in 1987. In 1987 he became an Assistant Cook County State's Attorney. In 1998 he began a solo practice focusing on criminal defense matters.

Mr. Studenroth is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. He has litigation experience and is reported to be a solid practitioner. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Alan M. Jacob – Not Recommended

Alan M. Jacob did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds him Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

## Joel Chupack -- Qualified

Joel Chupack was admitted to practice in 1982. He is a partner in the private practice firm of Heinrich & Kramer P.C, with an emphasis in real estate related litigation, including forclosure, tax deed, eviction, building court, mechanics' liens, chancery actions, and probate. He has presided over 200 arbitrations as a member of the Commericial Panel of the American Arbitration Association. He reports having an active litigation practice. From 1986 to 1990 he was a litigation associate with McBride Baker & Coles. Mr. Chupak is active in Bar Association activities and has worked on real estate related legislation as a member of the ISBA Real Estate Section Council. He is considered to have good legal ability and is reported to be very knowledgeable about his areas of practice. He has a good temperament and is hard-working. He is praised for his work as an arbitrator. He has litigation experience. In general, Mr. Chupack is considered to be a good lawyer. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Carmine Vincent Trombetta – Qualified**

Carmine Vincent Trombetta was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1983. Since 1984, he has worked as a Solo Practitioner at the Law Firm of Carmine V. Trombetta in Schaumberg, IL. He represents clients in criminal cases and in civil litigation, real estate, wills and trusts, and bankruptcy matters.

Mr. Trombetta is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. He has substantial litigation experience in a variety of both criminal and civil matters. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### **Thomas Raymond Molitor – Qualified**

Thomas Raymond Molitor was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1985. Since that time, he has been a Solo Practitioner at the Law Office of Thomas R. Molitor, where he focuses on general practice and litigation, including wills, trust, and real estate matters. He is a Member and Founding President of the Northfield Bar Association.

Mr. Molitor is considered to have good legal ability. He is praised as a solid practitioner with good legal knowledge and temperament. He has substantial litigation experience and is reported to have good trial skills. He was censured in 2001 for failing to effectuate service on a defendant in a personal injury case. But this is a minor blemish in an otherwise respected career. On balance, the Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# 13th Subcircuit

# Vacancy of the Hon. Clayton J. Crane

## Gary W. Seyring -- Qualified

Gary W. Seyring was admitted to practice in 1978. He is also a Certified Public Accountant. He is a solo practitioner focusing on domestic relations, real estate, estate planning, tax planning, and business law. A substantial percentage of Mr. Seyring's practice involves litigation. He is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Susanne Groebner –Qualified

Susanne Groebner was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2000. Since 2001, she has worked as an Assistant State's Attorney in the Cook County State's Attorney Office, where she currently works in the Felony Trial Division in Rolling Meadows, IL (2013-present). She previously served in the Felony Trial Division in Chicago (2008-2013); in the Felony Review, Preliminary Hearings, and Grand Jury Units (2004-2008); in the Juvenile Division (Abuse and Neglect/Delinquency, 2001-2004); and in the Child Support Division (2001).

Ms. Groebner is considered to have good legal ability. Respondents to this evaluation say that she has good litigation skills and that she is an honest and fair prosecutor. She has substantial litigation experience in more complex matters. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Ketki Shroff Steffen -- Qualified

Ketki Shroff Steffen was admitted to practice in 1991. She was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2015 and served until December 2016. She was a career Assistant State's Attorney for Cook County. She reports being lead counsel in 30 trials that have gone to a jury verdict and over 500 that have gone to a bench verdict. She has litigated 13 cases on appeal. Ms. Steffen is reported to have good legal ability and temperament. She enjoys a reputation as a trusted and experienced criminal law litigator. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Jeffrey Lawrence

## **Daniel P. Fitzgerald – Qualified**

Daniel P. Fitzgerald was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1991. Since 2005, he has worked as a litigation attorney for the Walgreen Company, where he currently serves as Senior Counsel. He focuses on health care litigation but has also handled employment law and environmental law cases. Previously, he was Chief Legal Counsel and Chief of the Bureau of Administrative Litigation of the Office of the Inspector General, Illinois Department of Health Care and Family Services (2002-2005); General Counsel to the Illinois Racing Board (1999-2002); Assistant State's Attorney in the Illinois Attorney General's Office (1993-1999); and Judicial Law Clerk in the Cook County Circuit Court, Chancery Division (1991-1993).

Mr. Fitzgerald is considered to have good legal ability with a wide range of litigation and other legal experience. He has handled complex litigation on his own and as a supervisor of outside counsel. His is reported to possess a good temperament. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Hon. Michael P. Gerber – Qualified

Hon. Michael P. Gerber was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1980. He was appointed to the bench as a Circuit Judge by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2016. He presides over criminal misdemeanors, felony preliminary hearings, and traffic matters. Previously, he worked as an Assistant State's Attorney in Cook County, where he prosecuted criminal matters (1984-2016); an Assistant Public Defender in Cook County (1981-1984), where he handled motions and trials and, during his last 18 months there, felony preliminary hearings; and as an associate for Martin S. Gerber (1980-1981), where he handled civil municipal and misdemeanor cases in the Circuit Court of Cook County.

As a lawyer, Judge Gerber was considered to be an outstanding practitioner with very good legal ability and temperament. He was respected for his litigation skills and he had substantial litigation experience in more complex matters. He is reported to be exceptionally knowledgeable. As a judge he is reported to be handling a high volume call with efficiency and fairness. On the basis of this 2017 evaluation the Council would have found Judge Gerber to be Well Qualified.

However, subsequent to the evaluation the Council conducted in 2017, the Council notes that a post conviction judge vacated a murder case conviction that then Mr. Gerber had prosecuted many years earlier. In vacating the conviction, the judge stated in regard to Mr. Gerber, as the prosecutor, that he had made "factually false arguments to the jury" about a key piece of evidence. The judge further stated,

"This Court cannot say the prosecutor's improper remarks did not contribute to petitioner's conviction; a jury could have reached a contrary verdict had the improper remarks not been made. \* \* \* Indeed, such statements amounted to a purposeful due process violation that led to petitioner's conviction. As such, petitioner was prejudiced by appellate counsel's failure to raise this claim."

The defendant was exonerated. The Council considers these findings to be exceptionally serious. However, the Council also must consider the totality of Judge Gerber's well-respected career. In a close call, the Council finds Judge Gerber to be Qualified for the Circuit Court.

## Shannon P. O'Malley – Not Recommended

Shannon P. O'Malley did not participate in the evaluation process. The Council finds him Not Recommended for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Ann O'Donnell

#### Alice Christine Svenson – Qualified

Alice Christine Svenson was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1995. She is the Principal at Svenson Law Offices, where she focuses on family law, federal and state election law, and

employment law. Previously, she handled workers compensation cases at Stone and Johnson (Associate and Partner, 1998-2008) and at Ridge and Downes (Associate, 1995-1998). She has participated in serval bar associations including the Republican National Lawyers Association, where she served on the Board of Governors and as the Finance Chair and the Illinois State Chapter Chair. She has provided pro bono legal services to divorced fathers through the organization Fathers Helping Fathers.

Ms. Svenson has a variety of legal experiences, including litigation experience in workers compensation cases and domestic relations matters. She has relatively little recent trial experience, although she maintains a motion practice. Respondents say she has demonstrative good litigation skills and she is reported to have a good temperament. There have been a few client complaints concerning her diligence, but on balance, she appears to be a good practitioner. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Hon. Samuel J. Betar, III – Qualified

Hon. Samuel J. Betar, III was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1983. Since 2012, he has served as an Associate Judge assigned to the Third Municipal District, where he handles traffic, criminal, domestic violence, housing, civil and parentage matters. He was appointed as a Circuit Judge by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2017. His previous assignments include Domestic Relations, Third Municipal District (2003-2012), Post Judgment Collections, First Municipal District (1999-2003), and First Municipal District, Housing Court (1999). He was also an Associate at Arnold and Kadjan, where he handled labor law and litigation (1991-1998); an Associate at Kamensky and Rubinstein, where he handled commercial litigation (1986-1991), and an Associate at the Botti Law Firm (1983-1986). He is a member of several bar associations, including the Northwest Suburban bar association, where he has Co-Chaired the Matrimonial Law Committee.

Lawyers appearing before Judge Betar consider him to have good legal ability and to have good temperament. He is praised for his ability to manage a large call and for his patience and communication skills with litigants and lawyers. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# 14<sup>th</sup> Subcircuit

# Vacancy of the Hon. Rodolfo Garcia

#### Hon. Marina E. Ammendola – Qualified

Hon. Marina E. Ammendola was admitted to practice in 1989 and was appointed to the bench by the Illinois Supreme Court in 2017. She has been a sole practitioner since 2001, focusing on tort litigation matters. She also serves as a Guardian ad Litem.

Judge Ammendola is considered to have good legal ability and is widely praised for her litigation skills and for her temperament. She has substantial litigation experience in more complex matters. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Beatriz A. Frausto-Sandoval – Not Qualified

Beatriz A. Frausto-Sandoval was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 2005. Since 2011, she has been a Solo Practitioner at the Law Office of Beatriz A. Frausto-Sandoval, where she focuses on

immigration law and related matters. She has also worked as a full-time Contract Attorney at Hudson Legal (2011-2012), where she handled document review in contract litigation cases and an Associate with a focus on immigration law at both Hughes Socol Piers Resnik and Dym, Ltd. (2006-2011) and the Law Office of Scott. E. Bellgrau in Bensenville, IL (2005-2006).

Ms. Frausto-Sandoval specializes in immigration law and is praised for her knowledge of that area of law. She is reported to have good temperament. The Council is concerned, however, with the depth and breadth of her practice. She has been a lawyer since 2005 and focuses almost exclusively on immigration work, which does not include state court practice. The Council finds her Not Qualified for the Circuit Court of Cook County.

# 15<sup>th</sup> Subcircuit

# Vacancy of the Hon. George Scully, Jr.

#### Ashonta Rice-Akiwowo – Not Qualified

Ashonta Rice-Akiwowo was admitted to the Illinois bar in 2005. She immediately began as a Cook County Assistant Public Guardian. There, she represented minors in abuse proceedings. In 2007, she started a solo practice specializing in Family law.

Ms. Rice-Akiwowo enjoys a reputation of being a smart and knowledgeable practitioner. She is praised for her temperament which is often described as respectful and professional. She reports a significant number of trials. The Council is concerned, however, because of the combination of depth and breadth of her experience, particularly in light of the relatively few years she has been a lawyer. The Council finds her Not Qualified for the Circuit Court at this time.

# Michael Brendan Barrett -- Qualified

Michael Brendan Barrett was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1991. Since 1992, he has worked for Barrett & Sramek, where is a partner focusing on personal injury, probate and estate planning, and worker's compensation cases. He previously worked as an associate at Moss & Hillison (1991-1992). Mr. Barrett provides pro bono legal services to not-for-profit youth sports organizations, including Vikings Youth Hockey, Amateur Hockey Association of Illinois, Illinois Hockey Officials' Association, and Chicago Fury Youth Hockey. He has held bar association offices and committee memberships including president of the Southwest Bar Association; judicial evaluations investigator and member of the Tort Law Section Council for the Illinois Bar Association; judicial evaluations investigator for the Chicago Bar Association; and vice chairman of the Judicial Screening Committee for the Coalition of Suburban Bar Associations.

Mr. Barrett is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. He is knowledgeable and is reported to have good trial skills. He has substantial litigation experience is well-respected as a practitioner. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

# Vacancy of the Hon. Frank G. Zelezinski

## Karla Marie Fiaoni—Qualified

Karla Marie Fiaoni was admitted to the Illinois Bar in 1989. Since 2001, she has been the Sole Practitioner and Owner of the Law Office of Karla Marie Fiaoni in Homewood, IL. Her legal practice is focused on criminal defense, family law, and Secretary of State Administration hearings. She has previously served as an Assistant State's Attorney in the Cook County State's Attorney Office (1989-1994), the Chief of Police of the City of Chicago Heights, IL (1994-1996), and Project Director of the Domestic Violence Unit of the City of Chicago Heights. She is a Member and Past President of two bar associations: the Women's Criminal Defense Bar Association and the South Suburban Bar Association.

Ms. Fiaoni is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. She has a variety of legal experiences. She is respected as a solid lawyer who cares about her clients and who is a zealous advocate for them. Ms. Fiaoni has a range of experience which translates well into what is needed for her to be a good judge. The Council finds her Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Hon. Anthony Swanagan – Qualified

Hon. Anthony Swanagan was admitted to practice in 1987, and was appointed to the Circuit Court by the Illinois Supreme Court in April 2017. Before taking the bench Judge Swanagan had served as a career clerk to U.S. District Court Judge Andrea R. Wood of the U.S. District Court. He has also clerked for Justice William White in the Illinois Appellate Court, and for Judge Sharon Johnson Coleman of the U.S. federal court. Earlier in his career, Judge Swanagan was a litigator in civil matters with Jones, Ware & Grenard and served as corporate counsel for Galileo International, Inc.

Judge Swanagan is considered to have good legal ability. As a lawyer, he had litigation experience earlier in his career, and is widely praised for his writing skills and analytic thinking as a law clerk in both the state and federal courts. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

#### Scott Darrell McKenna -- Qualified

Scott Darrell McKenna was admitted to practice in 1996. Mr. McKenna is currently a partner at Best, Vanderlaan & Harrington. He is the principal trial attorney for a caseload of approximately 175 civil cases. He also is responsible for interviewing and hiring attorneys, mentoring attorneys, reviewing client bills and management of the firm. From 1997 to 2000, Mr. McKenna was an associate at Richard B. Bogich & Associates (now known as Winters Salzetta O'Brien & Richardson). He handled plaintiff personal injury matters at both the trial and appellate levels.

Mr. McKenna is considered to have good legal ability and temperament. His career includes law firm management and extensive experience as a litigator in civil matters. The Council finds him Qualified for the Circuit Court.

Chicago Council of Lawyers 750 N. Lake Shore Dr. 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Chicago, Illinois 60611 Phone: 312-988-6565 Email: malcolmrich@chicagocouncil.org Website: www.chicagocouncil.org